

## MEMORANDUM

June 9, 2016

**To:** MEMBERS, PORT COMMISSION  
Hon. Willie Adams, President  
Hon. Kimberly Brandon, Vice President  
Hon. Leslie Katz  
Hon. Eleni Kounalakis  
Hon. Doreen Woo Ho

**FROM:** Elaine Forbes  
Interim Executive Director

**SUBJECT:** Request for authorization to award contracts to (1) COWI/OLMM Consulting Engineers Joint Venture, (2) GHD/Telamon Engineering Consultants Joint Venture, (3) Moffat & Nichol/AGS Joint Venture, and (4) Parsons/Lotus Water Joint Venture, for as-needed engineering and related professional services, each contract in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000

**DIRECTOR'S RECOMMENDATION:** Approve the Attached Resolution

---

### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Pursuant to Port Commission authorization (Resolution 16-01), Port staff issued a Request for Qualifications ("RFQ") soliciting as-needed engineering and related professional services on March 4, 2016. Six proposals were submitted by joint venture consulting firms in response to the RFQ. One firm was deemed non-responsive by Port staff for failing to meet the RFQ's minimum qualifications. The Contract Monitoring Division ("CMD") determined that the five remaining firms met the City's Local Business Enterprise ("LBE") Ordinance requirements. A selection panel then evaluated and scored the written proposals and held oral interviews. CMD monitored the panel evaluation process and applied the LBE joint venture rating bonus to all five firms.

Port staff now seeks Port Commission authorization to award professional services contracts for as-needed engineering and related professional services to COWI/OLMM Consulting Engineers Joint Venture ("COWI/OLM"), GHD/Telamon Engineering Consultants Joint Venture ("GHD/Telamon"), Moffatt & Nichol/AGS Joint Venture

**This Print Covers Calendar Item No. 10B**

("M&N/AGS"), and Parsons/Lotus Water Joint Venture ("Parsons/Lotus Water"). Each proposed contract will have a not-to-exceed amount of \$1,500,000 and a term of four years with an option for an additional year at the Port's sole discretion. The cumulative value of the four contracts is \$6,000,000 over a maximum term of five years.

The contracts are funded through the Port's annual operating budget and proceeds from general obligation and revenue bonds.

## **STRATEGIC OBJECTIVE**

This contracting opportunity supports the goals of the Port's Strategic Plan as follows:

### Livability:

*By increasing the proportion of funds spent by the Port with LBE and micro-LBE firms.*

### Renewal:

*By utilizing engineering services to implement infrastructure projects that improve and preserve Port's structures, maritime facilities, roads, utilities, parks and historical resources.*

### Resiliency:

*By assessing all pending and new projects for the effects of rising sea level and ensuring appropriate adaptation measures.*

## **BACKGROUND**

On March 6, 2013, pursuant to Port Commission approval, the Port entered into "as-needed" engineering and professional related professional services contracts with Creegan + D'Angelo/AGS Joint Venture, Gerwick/SDE Joint Venture, and Parsons Brinckerhoff/Structus Joint Venture ("PB/Structus"). All three as-needed agreements included a maximum dollar value of \$1,500,000 and an initial term of three years that was extended for one additional year. Although the three existing as-needed engineering and related professional services contracts will not expire until March 30, 2017, pursuant to the San Francisco Administrative Code no new contract service orders could be issued after March 30, 2016.

Projects under these existing agreements included engineering services for the Copra Crane rehabilitation, the Blue Greenway Signage Project, building and roof repairs at Piers 31 and 35, sewer system upgrade at Pier 80, and protection feasibility analysis at Wharf J9 and Pier 43 ½. The overall LBE subcontracting performance is currently 37% or 16% over the CMD set goal of 21%. Port staff expects all of the contracts to close above the CMD LBE subcontracting goal.

On January 12, 2016, the Port Commission authorized staff to advertise an RFQ for as-needed engineering and related professional services (Port Commission Resolution 16-01). Staff also secured the requisite Civil Service Commission approval prior to advertising the RFQ for up to four contracts with maximum five year terms and a not-to-exceed aggregate amount of \$6,000,000 on March 7, 2016. The RFQ incorporated a

LBE subcontracting goal of 20% as determined by the Port's CMD Contract Compliance Officer.

### Scope of Work

Due to the nature of as-needed services, it is not feasible to define a specific scope of work in advance for the proposed contracts. The specific scopes of work will vary with differing project needs. The type of project activities and facility work anticipated under this contract includes (but is not limited to) engineering services that support dredging, the construction of bridges, harbors, pilings (marine and land based) seawalls/wharfs, general utilities, security enhancements, and renovation design work. In addition, contractors may also be requested to provide engineering cost estimates, specifications and peer reviews.

As with the prior as-needed engineering contracts, Port project managers will be able to utilize these as-needed contractors through a variety of selection methods, ranging from direct solicitation of a particular team to the development of informal Requests for Proposals (RFP) that will be issued to all of the teams. The method which Port chooses will depend on the scope and urgency of the project. The Port project manager will choose the team whose proposal represents the best value and qualifications for the specific project. After negotiating a reasonable fee for specified services, staff will issue a Contract Service Order (CSO) to the selected firm and a notice to proceed will be issued to commence work under the Port project manager's oversight.

### **SELECTION PROCESS**

On March 4, 2016, the Port issued the RFQ, with submittals due on April 8, 2016. A pre-submittal meeting was held on March 23, 2016. Over 65 people representing 55 unique engineering and related professional service firms attended the pre-submittal meeting.

The Port received seven responses to the RFQ in advance of the April 8, 2016 submittal deadline. Of the seven proposals received, only one firm provided adequate information to meet a minimum qualification in the RFQ requiring significant experience working with shoreside power systems. Port staff determined that this requirement negatively impacted the competitive bidding environment due to a lack of qualified firms with this specific expertise. Upon reconsideration, Port staff re-issued the solicitation without the shoreside power minimum qualification on April 25, 2016. Firms that had previously submitted proposals were given the opportunity to submit updated proposals or to allow the Port to review their existing proposal without considering the shoreside power minimum qualification.

In advance of the April 25, 2016 submittal deadline, the Port received six proposals. Three firms opted to submit new proposals and three firms asked the Port to consider their original proposal. Five of the six responses consisted of one lead consultant partnering with a LBE joint venture partner. The following six joint venture consultant teams responded to the RFQ:

1. COWI/OLMM
2. GHD/Telamon
3. M&N/AGS
4. Parsons/Lotus Water
5. PB/Structus
6. Win Structural

Port staff reviewed and determined that one firm, Win Structural, did not meet the RFQ's minimum qualifications. CMD then reviewed the submittals and determined that the five remaining firms complied with the RFQ's LBE requirements.

#### Selection Panel

A three-member selection panel was convened to evaluate and score proposals on May 18, 2016. The panel consisted of a civil engineer from the Port and two senior engineers from San Francisco Public Works. The panel members have expertise in civil, structural, and electrical engineering. The Port's CMD Compliance Officer approved the panel composition and attended all selection panel meetings.

#### Evaluation Criteria

Written proposals were evaluated and scored by the selection panel based upon the following criteria:

- 30 points – technical approach
- 20 points – prime consultant and team experience
- 20 points – assigned project staff
- 20 points – organization
- 10 points – subconsultant resources
- 100 points total

Port staff forwarded all five proposals to the second phase of the evaluation process for oral interviews. On May 26, 2016, the panel evaluated and scored the oral interviews based upon the following criteria:

- 40 points – prime consultant, subcontractor, and project staff experience
- 30 points – technical approach
- 30 points – organization & accountable contracting
- 100 points total

The City Administrative Code Chapter 14B, the LBE and Non-Discrimination in Contracting Ordinance, establishes rating bonuses for LBE joint venture partnerships. All five proposers were granted a 7.5 percent rating bonus allowed under the ordinance. The complete rankings are shown in Table 1. The top-ranked four firms were selected for contract award. Port staff issued a Notice of Intent to Award Contracts on May 27, 2016.

Table 1: As Needed Engineering RFQ Proposal Scores

Proposer	Written Proposal Score (Avg/Total)	Oral Interview Score (Avg/Total)	LBE Rating Bonus	Final Total Score	Final Ranking
M&N/AGS	95/285	98/293	7.5%	207/621	1
GHD/Telamon	87/260	99/297	7.5%	200/599	2
Parsons/Lotus Water	91/274	94/283	7.5%	200/599	3
COWI/OLMM	92/277	88/265	7.5%	194/583	4
PB/Structus	88/264	91/273	7.5%	192/577	5

## SELECTED CONSULTANTS

### About COWI/OLMM

COWI (formerly Ben C. Gerwick, Inc.) served as a prime consultant on the Port's previous as-needed engineering contract. COWI and their LBE joint venture partner OLMM will be jointly managing this contract, with COWI taking the lead on pier, marina, and ferry terminal type projects. OLMM will lead projects on buildings over piers, transportation, railroads, and utility projects. OLMM is a LBE firm operating in San Francisco for 29 years. They have extensive experience working on projects with the Ports of Oakland and San Francisco and their previous project experience includes the San Francisco Public Library and the City Hall retrofit. The COWI/OLMM team includes twenty subconsultant firms of which twelve are certified LBEs.

### About GHD/Telamon

GHD has significant experience with Port of San Francisco projects, including the Brannan Street Wharf, the substructure assessment of Pier 27, and most recently, the Earthquake Vulnerability Study of the Northern Seawall. Their LBE joint venture partner, Telamon, has provided civil engineering and land surveying services for the City and County of San Francisco for the past 22 years. The GHD/Telamon team will employ seventeen subconsultant firms of which nine are certified LBEs.

### About Moffatt & Nichol/AGS

Moffatt & Nichol and their LBE joint venture partner, AGS, have 25 years of experience working together beginning with the Pier 45/Fisherman's Wharf Seafood Center and Harbor project in the 1990's. Moffatt & Nichol's emphasis is marine structural, civil, and coastal engineering while AGS will focus on geotechnical, environmental, civil, structural engineering, construction management, and special inspections. The M&N/AGS team includes 12 subconsultant firms of which seven are LBEs.

### About Parsons/Lotus Water

Parsons has nearly 70 years of experience with projects involving design, engineering, and construction management at ports and marine facilities. Parsons has previous project experience with the Ports of San Francisco, Oakland, and Long Beach. Lotus Water is a civil engineering LBE firm established nine years ago. Lotus Water (previously Sustainable Watershed Design, Inc.) has worked on infrastructure and design projects with San Francisco Public Works and the San Francisco Public Utilities

Commission. The Parsons/Lotus Water team consists of eleven subconsultants of which five are LBEs.

## **FUNDING**

Funding for these services will be allocated on an annual basis through either the Port operating budget or capital budget. Some services may be funded through the proceeds of General Obligation or Port Revenue Bonds. Funding for each CSO will be identified prior to requesting proposals from the as-needed contractors.

## **SCHEDULE**

The planned contracting schedule is:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Target Date</u>
Port Commission Authorization to Award Contract	June 14, 2016
Notice To Proceed	August 1, 2016

## **RECOMMENDATION**

Port staff request authorization to award contracts to (1) COWI/OLMM Consulting Engineers Joint Venture, (2) GHD/Telamon Engineering Consultants Joint Venture, (3) Moffatt & Nichol/AGS Joint Venture and (4) Parsons/Lotus Water Joint Venture, for as-needed engineering and professional related services, each in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000, with an initial term of four years and an option to extend the term for an additional year at the Port's sole discretion. The cumulative value of the four proposed contracts is \$6,000,000 over a maximum term of four years. The contracts are funded through the Port's operating and capital budgets.

Prepared by: Boris Delepine, Contracts Administrator  
Finance and Administration Division

and

Joe Roger, Structural Engineer  
Engineering Division

For: John Woo, Acting Deputy Director  
Finance and Administration Division

and

Eunejune Kim, Deputy Director  
Engineering Division

## Attachments

A: CMD Award Memo

**PORT COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**RESOLUTION NO. 16-24**

- WHEREAS, Port staff requires consultant engineering and related professional services expertise and assistance for current and future design and infrastructure projects; and
- WHEREAS, the Port's current set of three as-needed engineering and related professional services contracts, awarded pursuant to Port Commission authorization in 2012, have provided a timely and cost-effective vehicle for the provision of such professional services; and
- WHEREAS, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 6.64, no new service orders can be issued in furtherance of these current contracts after March 30, 2016 because all service orders must be issued within three years of the contract's award, and further services will be needed after these contracts expire on March 30, 2017; and
- WHEREAS, on January 12, 2016, the Port Commission authorized staff to issue a Request for Qualifications ("RFQ") to solicit and select as-needed engineering and related professional services (Port Commission Resolution 16-01); and
- WHEREAS, on March 7, 2016 Port staff received approval from the Civil Service Commission (PSC #41769-15/16) to contract with a maximum of four private consulting firms for as-needed engineering and related professional services with a maximum term of five years and a not-to-exceed amount of \$6,000,000 for all contracts; and
- WHEREAS, Port staff advertised the RFQ on March 4, 2016 and received six proposals on April 25, 2016, of which five were deemed responsive to the requirements of the RFQ; and
- WHEREAS, pursuant to the RFQ on May 18, 2016 a three member selection panel was convened to evaluate and score proposals and after applying the LBE rating points, the City's Contract Monitoring Division and Port staff determined the following firms submitted the four highest-scoring proposals in response to the RFQ: (1) COWI/OLMM Consulting Engineers Joint Venture, (2) GHD/Telamon Engineering Consultants Joint Venture, (3) Moffat & Nichol/AGS Joint Venture, and (4) Parsons/Lotus Water Joint Venture; and
- WHEREAS, Based upon the final evaluation and scoring of the proposals, Port staff recommend the award of separate contracts to the four highest-scoring firms: (1) COWI/OLMM Consulting Engineers Joint Venture, (2)

GHD/Telamon Engineering Consultants Joint Venture, (3) Moffat & Nichol/AGS Joint Venture, and (4) Parsons/Lotus Water Joint Venture, for as-needed engineering and related professional services, each contract in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000, with an initial term of four years and an option to extend the term for an additional year at the Port's sole discretion; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that the Port Commission hereby authorizes the award of separate contracts to: (1) COWI/OLMM Consulting Engineers Joint Venture, (2) GHD/Telamon Engineering Consultants Joint Venture, (3) Moffat & Nichol/AGS Joint Venture, and (4) Parsons/Lotus Water Joint Venture, for as-needed engineering and related professional services, each contract in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000, with an initial term of four years and an option to extend the term for an additional year at the Port's sole discretion; and, be it further

RESOLVED, that the Port Commission further authorizes Port staff to execute necessary contract documents, in such form as approved by the City Attorney's office, for such purpose.

***I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Port Commission at its meeting of June 14, 2016.***

---

Secretary