



## MEMORANDUM

December 9, 2022

**TO:** MEMBERS, PORT COMMISSION  
Hon. Willie Adams, President  
Hon. Kimberly Brandon, Vice President  
Hon. John Burton  
Hon. Gail Gilman  
Hon. Steven Lee

**FROM:** Elaine Forbes  
Executive Director 

**SUBJECT:** Request authorization to award four contracts to (1) Arcadis/Lotus Water Joint Venture (2) COWI/TECA Joint Venture (3) GHD/Structus Joint Venture and (4) Moffatt & Nichol OLMM Joint Venture for As-needed Engineering and Related services, each contract in an amount not to exceed \$4,000,000 and to create a pre-qualified pool.

**DIRECTOR'S RECOMMENDATION:** Approve the Attached Resolution No. 22-68

---

### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Pursuant to Port Commission authorization (Resolution 22-25), Port staff issued a Request for Qualifications for As-Needed Engineering and Related Services. Seven proposals were submitted by firms in response to the RFQ. All firms were responsive and met the eligibility requirements of the Contract Monitoring Division ("CMD") for eligibility requirements with the Local Business Enterprise ("LBE") Ordinance. A selection panel evaluated and scored the written proposals and held oral interviews. CMD monitored the selection process.

Port staff now seeks Port Commission authorization to award contracts for As-Needed Engineering and Related services to the four highest-scoring firms: (1) Arcadis/Lotus Water Joint Venture (2) COWI/TECA Joint Venture (3) GHD/Structus Joint Venture (4) Moffatt & Nichol OLMM Joint Venture. Staff recommends the award of each contract in the not-to-exceed amount of \$4,000,000, with a maximum term of five years.

Port staff seek Port Commission authorization to create a ranked prequalified pool for a period of two years. Contracts issued from this prequalified pool will have a duration of no longer than two years. Port staff will follow solicitation requirements for award of additional contracts, including seeking Port Commission approval for contracts from the pool with a value greater than \$1,000,000.

## **STRATEGIC PLAN OBJECTIVE**

The contract opportunity will support the goals of the Port's Strategic Plan as follows:

Evolution and Productivity: By transforming the waterfront to create vibrant new neighborhoods for residents, retail, commercial and employees.

Equity: By increasing the proportion of funds spent by the Port with local businesses competing for Port contracts by engaging teams that support the diversity of the City.

Resiliency: By improving the Port's resiliency to earthquake and the impacts of climate change, including sea level rise.

## **BACKGROUND**

In Fiscal Year 2018-2019, the Port entered four (4) master agreements for as-needed engineering and related services pursuant to Port Commission approvals. The four master agreements included a maximum dollar value of \$3,000,000 each. All four agreements had an initial term of four years. The four prime contractors under the existing contracts are Arcadis/Lotus Water Joint Venture, Parsons/Ryan Joyce Structural Design Joint Venture, Stantec/McGovern McDonald Joint Venture and Terra Engineers. Each of the teams also include several subconsultants in a variety of professional disciplines.

## **SCOPE OF WORK**

The exact scope of work for consultant assistance during the next four to five years is not fully known, but staff anticipates the needs for support in the below categories of work.

### Primary Categories of Work

- Structural Engineering including Marine Structures Engineering
- Coastal Engineering
- Geotechnical Engineering including Marine Geotechnical Engineering
- Civil Engineering
- Mechanical Engineering
- Construction Management
- Electrical Engineering including high voltage
- Fire Protection Engineering
- Environmental Engineering including hazardous material evaluation and monitoring
- Permit/Building Construction Inspection Services
- Mooring and Berthing Analysis and Design
- Architecture
- Historic Preservation
- ADA Design, Inspections, and ADA Transition Plan
- CAD Support Services
- Facility Inspection

- Constructability Reviews including Value Engineering and Peer Review
- Cost Estimating
- Specification Writing (Construction and Professional Services)
- Special Inspection and Testing
- Utility Location Services

Secondary Categories of Work

- Project Management
- Project Programming and Planning
- Demolition Engineering
- Corrosion Engineering
- Railroad Engineering Consulting
- Marina Design
- Resilience Planning
- Crane Inspection, Testing and Certification Services
- Materials Testing
- Facility Security Evaluation Services
- Grant Application Support
- Building Permit Plan Review
- Cruise Terminal Operations
- Economic Studies
- Life-Cycle Cost Analysis
- Pile Driving Barge Design
- Shoreside power Design
- Dry Dock Inspection and Design
- Building Occupancy Resumption Program
- Forensic Investigation
- Construction Litigation Support
- Code Development
- Environmental Support Services including CEQA and NEPA

Tertiary Categories of Work

- Archeology
- Envision Review
- LEED Certification and Standards
- Utility and Energy Efficiency
- Green Building Design
- Elevator/Escalator Consulting
- Enterprise Asset Management System Development
- Transportation and Traffic Engineering
- Community Relations
- Interpretive Sign Design and Reproduction

Port staff wanted to ensure the responding teams would create a realistic assignment of LBE work and capped the maximum LBE credit for a single secondary and tertiary

scopes of work. A single category for a secondary scope of work had a 5% maximum and a tertiary scope of work had a 1% maximum for a single scope of work.

## **CONTRACT ADVERTISEMENT AND OUTREACH**

On July 5, 2022, the Port published the RFQ for As-Needed Engineering and Related Professional Services, Event ID 0000007201. The outreach list for this opportunity included 570 contacts with potential respondents, subconsultants, chambers of commerce and other professional organizations. The Port held a pre-submittal conference on July 13, 2022 with 122 participants. The Port responded to 51 questions and received proposals in advance of the August 10, 2022 deadline. During the responsiveness review, the Port identified an area of the RFQ where the Port determined that it was in the Port's best interest to reject all proposals and reissue the RFQ.

On August 22, 2022, the Port reissued the RFQ for As-Needed Engineering and Related Professional Services, Event ID 0000007341. The RFQ was revised to require that the Project Manager be an employee of the Prime respondent and included other minor clarifications to instructions. The Port provided instructions to allow for respondents from the previous RFQ event to resubmit their previous proposal with the addition of a new appendix to update the proposals with the additional information and a new signature page. The advertisement was posted on the Port website and the City and County of San Francisco Supplier Portal. The Port contacted 115 firms who had opted to stay on the outreach list. The Port responded to two questions about the RFQ and issued one addendum to extend the submittal due date to September 12, 2022.

## **SELECTION PROCESS**

Submittals were due on September 12, 2022 and the Port received seven responses to the RFQ in advance of the submittal deadline. The following seven consultant teams responded to the RFQ:

1. Arcadis/Lotus Water, a joint venture partnership between Arcadis U.S. Inc (Non-LBE) and Sustainable Watershed Designs Inc. dba Lotus Water (LBE-XBE)
2. COWI/TECI JV, a joint venture partnership between COWI North America, Inc (Non-LBE) and Telemon Engineering Consultants, Inc (LBE-XBE)
3. GHD/Structus JV, a joint venture partnership between GHD and Structus (LBE-MBE)
4. Moffatt & Nichol OLMM JV, a joint venture between Moffatt & Nichol (Non-LBE) and OLMM Consulting Engineers (LBE-XBE)
5. Parsons FMG JV, a joint venture between Parsons Transportation Group (Non-LBE) and FMG & Company (LBE-XBE)
6. Ryan Joyce Structural Design (LBE-WBE)
7. Stantec | MME JV, a joint venture between Stantec Consulting Services, Inc (Non-LBE) and McGovern McDonald Engineers (LBE-WBE)

All proposals were deemed responsive to the requirements of both Chapter 6 and the Chapter 14B.

### Selection Panel

The Port convened a five-member evaluation panel. The panel met on September 27 for orientation, on October 18 to confer and submit scores for the written proposals, and on November 3 for oral interviews. The five members of the panel included four individuals with engineering licenses and all panel members had experience with public sector public works projects. One individual is from the Port, one is from the Port of Oakland, two are from San Francisco Public Works, and one is from a construction-related non-profit. The Port's CMD Compliance Officer approved the panel composition and attended all selection panel meetings.

### Evaluation Criteria

The selection panel evaluated and scored the written proposals based upon the following criteria:

- 25 points – Proposer Approach and Experience
- 1 point – Submittal of a Diversity Equity and Inclusion Plan
- 20 points – Proposer and Sub-Consultant Firm Qualifications
- 24 points – Team Personnel Experience and Availability Table
- 10 points – Breadth of Services Proposed by Proposing Team
- 100 points Total

The RFQ required a respondent to score 75 points or more on the written proposal to be invited to attend the oral interview and qualify for the prequalified pool.

On November 3, 2022, the evaluation panel conducted oral interviews, evaluated and scored each candidate firm based on a presentation and three questions. Two of the questions were provided 48-hours prior to the interview and one interview question was asked in the interview.

The City Administrative Code Chapter 14B, the LBE and Non-Discrimination in Contracting Ordinance, establishes rating bonuses for LBE firms and LBE joint venture partnerships.

The complete rankings for firms advanced for the oral interview are shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Responses Scored for Written Proposal and Oral Interview

Proposer	LBE Rating Bonus Received	Written Proposal Score	Oral Interview	Final Total Score	Final Rank	Ethnicity <sup>1</sup>
Moffatt & Nichol /OLMM JV	7.5%	96.535	28.810	125.345	1	Leading JV – no information Non-Leading JV Asian American
COWI-TECI JV	7.5%	94.815	25.800	120.615	2	Leading JV – no information Non-Leading JV – Asian American
GHD Structus JV	7.5%	95.245	24.940	120.185	3	Leading JV – no information Non-Leading JV – Structus

<sup>1</sup> This information is for informational and data collection purposes only and may not be considered by the Port Commission when considering the approval or disapproval of any contract award. See Attachment 1, CMD Award memo.

Arcadis – Lotus Water JV	7.5%	91.805	27.950	119.755	4	Leading JV – no information Non-Leading – OBE
Ryan Joyce Structural Design	10%	88.220	27.500	115.720	5	No information
Stantec   MM JV	7.5%	91.375	23.005	114.380	6	No Information
Parsons FMG JV	5%	78.750	24.150	102.900	7	No Information

## SELECTED CONSULTANTS FOR CONTRACTS

Based on total scores, Port staff recommends awarding the As-Needed Engineering contracts to the top four ranking proposals. Each firm has proposed a team that meets or exceeds the 20% LBE requirement of the contracts.

### Arcadis/Lotus Water Joint Venture

Arcadis was founded over 100 years ago and is an international engineering firm that provides planning, design, engineering and construction management services. Lotus Water (LBE-OBE) is a San Francisco-based firm that provides engineering services. The Joint Venture partners clients have included the Port of San Francisco, the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission and waterfront clients for projects in Europe, Asia, and Australia. The team intends to exceed the LBE requirement with a 26.5% commitment to ten LBEs. This team also includes 6 non-LBEs.

### COWI-TECI Joint Venture

COWI North America was founded over 90 years ago and specializes in civil/structural marine and coastal engineering firm. Telamon (LBE-MBE) is a San-Francisco based firm that specializes in engineering services. The joint venture partners clients have included the Port of San Francisco, San Francisco International Airport, and marine infrastructure projects across the U.S. and abroad. The team intends to exceed the LBE requirement with a 22.50% to 20 LBEs. There are also 12 non-LBEs.

### GHD-Structus Joint Venture

GHD and Structus (LBE-MBE) have worked together for decades. GHD has multi-discipline engineering practice including a marine structural practice. Structus specializes in structural assessment and retrofit strategies. The Joint Venture partners' clients have included the Port of San Francisco and projects such as the Brannan Street Wharf and the San Francisco Fire Department's Fireboat Station 35 at Pier 22 ½. The team intends to exceed the LBE requirement with a 21.00% commitment with 11 LBEs. There are also 12 non-LBEs.

### Moffatt & Nichol/OLMM Joint Venture

Moffatt & Nichol has 75 years of experience with an international engineering practice. OLMM (LBE-OBE) is a San Francisco based structural engineering firm. The joint venture partner clients have included the Port of San Francisco, the Department of Public Works and waterfront work including the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management and the California State Lands Commission. The team intends to exceed the LBE requirement with 31.50% commitment to 16 LBEs. The team also includes 9 non-LBEs.

## SELECTED CONSULTANTS FOR PREQUALIFIED POOL

The RFQ specified that all responsive firms that score seventy-five points or more will be entered in the prequalified pools. The four firms that have been selected for contract award will be entered into the prequalified pool and the additional three teams include:

### Parsons | FMG Joint Venture

Parsons Transportation Group, Inc has 75 years as an engineering, construction, technical and management services firm. FMG + Company (LBE-WBE) is a San Francisco-based construction management and program management firm. The Joint Venture partners have worked on projects for is a structural FMG is a San Francisco-based firm with the Port of San Francisco, Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART), and the Water Emergency Transit Authority (WETA). The team intends to exceed the 20% LBE requirement with 22.6% to 12 LBEs. The team also includes 7 non-LBEs.

### Ryan Joyce Structural Design

Ryan Joyce Structural Design (LBE-WBE) is a San Francisco-based structural design. RJSD holds contracts with the Pory of San Francisco, San Francisco International Airport, and the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission. The team intends to meet the LBE requirement with 20% to LBEs. The team also includes 9 non-LBEs.

### Stantec | MM Joint Venture

Stantec has almost 60 years work for the City and County of San Francisco as a multi-service engineering firm. McGovern McDonald Engineers (OBE-WBE) is a San Francisco-based engineering firm. The joint venture partners have worked on projects with the Port of San Francisco, Public Works, and the U.S. Army Corp of Engineers. The team intends to exceed the LBE requirements with a 22% commitment to 18 LBEs. The team also includes 8 LBEs.

## FUNDING

Funding for these proposed contract services will be allocated on an annual basis through the Port's programmatic project budget.

## SCHEDULE

The planned contracting schedule is shown below:

<u>Activity</u>	<u>Target Date</u>
Port Commission Authorization to Award Contracts	December 2022
Contract Execution	February 2022
Contract Completion	Winter 2027

## RECOMMENDATION

Port staff requests authorization to award four contracts (1) Arcadis/Lotus Water Joint Venture (2) COWI/TECA Joint Venture 3) GHD/Structus Joint Venture and (4) Moffatt & Nichol OLMM Joint Venture for As-needed Engineering and Related services, each

contact in an amount not to exceed \$4,000,000 and to create a pre-qualified pool.

Prepared by: Stephanie Tang, Contracts and Procurement Manager  
Finance and Administration Division

For: Nate Cruz, Acting Chief Financial Officer  
Finance and Administration Division

and

Rod Iwashita, Chief Harbor Engineer  
Engineering Division

Attachments

A: CMD Award Memo



**PORT COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**RESOLUTION NO. 22-68**

- WHEREAS, In 2019, the Port Issue a Request for Qualifications (“RFQ”) for “As-Needed Engineering and Related Professional Services” to select consultants to provide comprehensive engineering and related professional services (site engineering, mechanical, electrical, architectural, landscape, civil, structural, transportation, geotechnical and design-related environmental engineering) to support the Port in its on-going efforts to effectively and economically develop, utilize and maintains its varied infrastructure and facility asses; and
- WHEREAS, the Port’s current set of as-needed Engineering and Related Professional Services contracts executive pursuant to the RFQ have provided a timely and cost-effective vehicle for provision of professional services; and
- WHEREAS, At its meeting on May 10, 2023 through Resolution 22-25, the Port Commission authorized staff to issue a Request for Qualifications (“RFQ”) to solicit and select up to four entities to provide as-needed engineering and related services each contract with a not-to-exceed value of four million dollars (\$4,000,000) for a total combined not-to-exceed value total of sixteen million dollars (\$16,000,000); and
- WHEREAS, Resolution 22-25 authorized staff to create a pre-qualified pool of qualified respondents for future solicitations and contract award; and
- WHEREAS, The Port Director has authority under Chapter 6 to award contacts at or below the minimum threshold amount, currently \$1,000,000;
- WHEREAS, Port staff advertised the RFQ on August 22, 2022 and received seven proposals on November 3, 2022; and
- WHEREAS, Port staff convened an evaluation panel to evaluate and score the proposals and hold oral interviews; and
- WHEREAS, Port staff selected the four highest responsive scored recipients, (1) Arcadis Lotus Water Joint Venture, (2) COWI/TECA Joint Venture 3) GHD/Structus Joint Venture and (4) Moffatt & Nichol OLMM Joint Venture for contract award; and

WHEREAS, Port staff ranked the proposals and the proposals from (1) Moffatt & Nichol OLMM Joint Venture, (2) COWI/TECA Joint Venture, (3) Arcadis/Lotus Water Joint Venture, (4) GHD/Structus Joint Venture, (5) Ryan Joyce Structural Design, (6) Stantec MM Joint Venture, and (7) Parsons FMG Joint Venture scored 75 points of above on the written proposal to qualify for a pre-qualified list; and

RESOLVED, that the Port Commission authorizes Port staff to award and negotiate Professional Services Contract Event ID: 0000007341 As-Needed Engineering and Related Services for the services described in the accompanying staff report and RFQ to (1) Arcadis/Lotus Water Joint Venture (2) COWI/TECA Joint Venture 3) GHD/Structus Joint Venture and (4) Moffatt & Nichol OLMM Joint Venture each in an amount not to exceed \$4,000,000 with a contract term of five (5) years and a total combined amount for immediate contract awards not to exceed \$16,000,000.

RESOLVED, that the Port Commission authorizes Port to create a prequalified pool from Event ID 0000007341 As-Needed Engineering Services for the following qualified firms in the below ranking (1) Moffatt & Nichol OLMM Joint Venture, (2) COWI/TECA Joint Venture, (3) Arcadis/Lotus Water Joint Venture, (4) GHD/Structus Joint Venture, (5) Ryan Joyce Structural Design, (6) Stantec MM Joint Venture, and (7) Parsons FMG Joint Venture; and

RESOLVED that the Port Commission authorizes Port staff to advertise additional contracts from the pre-qualified pool. Additional contracts from the prequalified pool that are at or below the threshold amount stated in Chapter 6, currently at \$1,000,000 shall be awarded by the Port Director. Contracts above the minimum competitive amount shall be awarded by the Port Commission.

***I hereby certify that the foregoing resolution was adopted by the Port Commission at its meeting of December 13, 2022.***

---

Secretary