



SAN FRANCISCO PORT COMMISSION

**JUNE 11, 2024
MINUTES OF THE MEETING**

MEMBERS, PORT COMMISSION

**HON. KIMBERLY BRANDON, PRESIDENT
HON. GAIL GILMAN, VICE PRESIDENT
HON. WILLIE ADAMS, COMMISSIONER
HON. ED HARRINGTON, COMMISSIONER
HON. STEVEN LEE, COMMISSIONER**

**ELAINE FORBES, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
JENICA LIU, COMMISSION AFFAIRS MANAGER**

CITY & COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

PORT COMMISSION

MINUTES OF THE MEETING

JUNE 11, 2024

1. CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL / RAMAYTUSH OHLONE LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Port Commission President Kimberly Brandon called the meeting to order at 2:30 p.m. The following Commissioners were present: Kimberly Brandon, Gail Gilman, Willie Adams, Ed Harrington, and Steven Lee.

The Commission Affairs Manager read the Ramaytush Ohlone Land Acknowledgment.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – April 30, 2024

ACTION: Vice President Gilman moved approval of the minutes. Commissioner Adams seconded the motion. The minutes were approved unanimously.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON EXECUTIVE SESSION

No Public Comment on Executive Session.

4. EXECUTIVE SESSION

A. Vote on whether to hold a closed session and to invoke the attorney-client privilege regarding the matters listed below as Conference with Legal Counsel.

ACTION: Commissioner Adams moved to go into closed session and invoke attorney-client privilege for Conference with Legal Counsel. Vice President Gilman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

(1) CONFERENCE WITH REAL PROPERTY NEGOTIATOR – This is specifically authorized under California Government Code Section 54956.8. *This session is closed to any non-City/Port representative: (Discussion Item)

a. Property: Bauer Intelligent Transportation, Pier 50 Shed A and Shed C, 401 Terry Francois Boulevard and Pier 96 (Leases L-15004 and L-16206 and parking stalls agreement)

Person Negotiating: Port: Kimberley Beal, Assistant Deputy Director Real Estate & Development

Negotiating Parties: Gary Bauer, Bauer Intelligent Transportation

Under Negotiation: ___ Price ___ Terms of Payment X Both

In this executive session, the Port's negotiators seek direction from the Port Commission on factors affecting the price and terms of payment, including price structure and other factors affecting the form, manner and timing of payment of the consideration for potential amendments to the subject leases and agreements. The executive session discussions will enhance the capacity of the Port Commission during the public deliberations and actions to set the price and payment terms that are most likely to maximize the benefits to the Port, the City and People of the State of California.

Present: President Kimberly Brandon
Vice President Gail Gilman
Commissioner Willie Adams
Commissioner Ed Harrington
Commissioner Steven Lee

Also present: Elaine Forbes, Port Director
Michael Martin, Assistant Port Director
Jenica Liu, Commission Affairs Manager
Scott Landsittel, Deputy Director, Real Estate & Development
Kimberley Beal, Assistant Deputy Director, Real Estate & Development
Jennifer Gee, Senior Property Manager
Karen Chan, Property Manager
Michelle Sexton, General Counsel

5. RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION

- A. Possible report on actions taken in closed session pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.1 and San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.12.

No Report.

- B. Vote in open session on whether to disclose any or all executive session discussions pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.1 and San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.12.

ACTION: Commissioner Adams moved to reconvene in open session without disclosing closed session discussions. Vice President Gilman seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

6. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Announcement of Prohibition of Sound Producing Electronic Devices during the Meeting: Please be advised that the ringing of and use of cell phones and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. The Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person responsible for the ringing of or use of a cell phone or other similar sound-producing electronic device.
- B. Announcement of Time Allotment for Public Comments: Please be advised that a member of the public has up to three minutes to make public comments on each agenda item unless the Port Commission adopts a shorter period on any item. Public comment must be in respect to the current agenda item. For in-person public comment, please fill out a speaker card and hand it to the Port Commission Affairs Manager. For remote public comment, instructions are on the first page of this agenda. During public comment, dial *3 to be added to the queue. An audio prompt will signal when it is your turn to speak.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEMS NOT LISTED ON THE AGENDA

Public comment is permitted on any matter within Port jurisdiction that is not an agenda item. No Port Commission action can be taken on any matter raised other than to schedule the matter for a future agenda, refer the matter to staff for investigation or respond briefly to statements made or questions posed by members of the public. (Government Code Section 54954.2(a))

No Public Comment on Items Not Listed on the Agenda.

9. EXECUTIVE

A. Executive Director's Report

- Economic Recovery
- Equity
- Key Project Updates
- Commendations for Port Retirees – Alan Gin, David Hu, Dan Hodapp
- Commendation for Commissioner Ed Harrington

Director Forbes: Good afternoon, President Brandon, Vice President Gilman, commissioners, Port staff and members of the public. I am Elaine Forbes, the Port's executive director. I have a lot to report out today. So I'll try to move through things.

First, it's Pride Month. Happy Pride Month. I want to say that this year's events will be throughout the month at the waterfront. We will have lots of things that are fun and exciting to do at Pride. And each June, you'll see our Pride flag flying at Pier 1 along with all of our other waterfront tenants. And we're really proud to fly the rainbow flag from Pier 1.

As you know, Pride is a wonderful celebration. It's a tribute to the city's heroism and inclusiveness. I am a queer department head. So Pride is especially important to me. And I've enjoyed the Pride parade for my entire growing up, as a young lesbian in the city.

And so I love Pride. And I also want to acknowledge that there are struggles that we're really going through for the trans community and for a continued evolution that young people are teaching us about gender fluidity. So we continue to be proud and prideful in our organization. So happy, happy, happy Pride.

June is also Juneteenth month -- Juneteenth. And we are celebrating. The first weekend this month, we hosted the return of Juneteenth on the Waterfront at Ferry Plaza. Mayor Breed came. She's come for every single Juneteenth since we started this program in 2021. This is with a lot of partnership: Foodwise; San Francisco Human Rights Commission's Dream Keeper Initiative, which provided the seed money and continues to invest; and the Ferry Building.

And Madam President, I really want to thank you for being the quiet force behind this program. We are seeing businesses that have started in kitchens and in garages on weekends grow to farmer's market -- to regular farmer's market starting six times a year and then to every Saturday and then to grow into having employees and business and scaling up.

This is not just one business that has gone through this but many. This last Juneteenth, we had 17 food and 10 retail vendors. So it was really, really exciting. Thank you so much.

This year, we're also going to have a new sculpture displayed, the Thomas J. Price sculpture -- he is the artist. We'll be unveiling the art. It celebrates diversity. We're doing this with the Arts Commission. It's a nine-foot-tall bronze sculpture depicting a BIPOC woman jogger. It's really a beautiful piece. The sculpture showcases the many ways to love our waterfront and reflects representation and equity.

Now, to our southern waterfront, we're going to be celebrating Islais Creek interpretative exhibit. The San Francisco Port is inviting stakeholders and the community to gather to celebrate the newly installed interpretive exhibit at Islais Creek. It really reveals and it protects history. The event takes place June 13th from 11:00 to 1:00 at Bayview Park -- Bayview Gateway Park in the Plaza behind the San Francisco Fire Station 25.

Thank you in advance President Brandon for coming down with us and saying a few words. We look forward to the event. It's really [accumulation] actually of a lot of work of planning and input from residents of Bayview/Dogpatch neighborhoods, maritime and labor historians and others. I

encourage everyone to get out and enjoy these activations along our beautiful waterfront.

And while you're out, like we all do as staff, please have fun. But also, please remember the Port needs to be clean, safe and vibrant for all to enjoy. So if you see something, call it in.

Turning to equity -- I told you it's a long report. This month, we're welcoming our summer interns. And we're really excited about it. Each division is hosting interns this summer. And in a new development, the Port has partnered with the Department of Police Accountability to host two interns from historically black colleges and universities.

We're going to have 15 interns joining us beginning June 10. The interns are a mix of school-aged and young adults. We're very eager to have them. And they actually will attend Port Commission in July. So you'll see everyone. They are going to be learning about policy, ports and commissioners, like yourselves. So I look forward to you meeting these wonderful young people.

Moving to resilience, on today's agenda, we hear a report from Port staff regarding the robust public engagement that has happened on our draft plan with the Army Corps of Engineers. We've gotten quite a few public comments. And you'll hear about that today.

We are on track for a June 28, Army Corps agency decision milestone. And that's when we hear from Army Corps leadership about progress on the study, what we're doing with the received comments. And you will hear more in your item about the disposition of all of the various public comments. So we're on track. And you'll hear more about that later.

Onto the civil grand jury, the civil grand jury released a report yesterday on the city's flood-management efforts entitled, "Come Hell or High Water, Flood Management in a Changing Climate." The report includes recommendations for interagency coordination. And we will be part of that interagency coordination. There are no specific actions related to the Port as a solo entity. And we will have 60 days to respond to the report.

I'm happy -- now, to key projects, I'm happy to report that the San Francisco Estuary Partnership voted our Heron's Head shoreline restoration project the outstanding environmental project of the year. The project won the award because it provides a valuable demonstration of nature-based approaches to managing erosion on our shoreline with excellent ecological outcomes.

And these nature-based solutions are also being monitored to see their value and how they go to other projects. So congratulations to the team in receiving such a prestigious award. The project was completed in December 2022.

In closing, commissioners, thank you for your steadfast leadership of all our strategic priorities. And now, I would like to turn to acknowledgments, of which I have several today. First, to Commissioner Lee, May was Asian American, Native Hawaiian, Pacific Islander Heritage Month. I want to recognize Commissioner Lee's efforts to highlight AAPI arts, culture and history through his work in Chinatown and with the sculpture of the transcontinental railroad workers.

NBC Bay Area had an in-depth piece on our own Commissioner Lee. It highlighted his many talents and many efforts he advances. It celebrated Commissioner Lee's deep dive into his contributions in the Chinese community and city overall. The piece is available on the NBC Bay Area website. Congratulations Commissioner Lee.

Commissioner Lee: Thank you.

Director Forbes: Now, on behalf of the leadership team, I'd like to move to retiring staff. And I'd like to acknowledge three people today, who have served the Port for a long time. And this is the -- a day of retirement. So we want to see them off well and appreciate their contribution.

So I'd like to start with Alan Gin. Where are you, Alan? Hello, Alan. Thank you. Alan has had a 17-year career with the Port and 33.5 years of combined service to the City and County of San Francisco. That is a long time, Alan. We're not going to talk about the year you entered the city, but it was a while ago.

Alan is a creative person who brings his personal touch to the work. His people skills have brought people together to find the best solution for the Port. Over the last 17 years, Alan has contributed to delivering over 17 -- I'm sorry, Alan -- \$75 million of project value. Thank you so much. That is really, really a huge contribution.

The projects range from: the large transformational work such as the new Brannan Street Wharf; to medium projects like the joint operation and security building at Hyde Street Pier; to COVID shelter-in-place projects in the southern waterfront; to smaller but also very important tenant improvements like Pier 1 and Pier 50.

He also had a hand in countless other repair projects to keep the Port in a state of good repair like -- I'm not -- if I keep going, we'll never stop -- 19, 19.5, 23, 29, 31. We have a lot of piers that [need] state of good repair, Alan. Thank you so much for all your work.

He also participated deeply in the Port's racial equity program, serving as a champion -- an equity champion to shift programs to bring contracting opportunity to small black and brown-owned businesses. Thank you, Alan, for your years of service, for your sacrifices to the city, for being an excellent public

employee and for keeping our portfolio safe and open to business.
Congratulations on your retirement.

President Brandon: Congratulations. [applause] And thank you so much for your service and dedication to the Port of San Francisco and the City and County of San Francisco. We really are sad to see you go but know that you're going to enjoy the next chapter. Do you want to say anything?

Alan Gin: No. [laughter]

Commissioner Adams: Hit the mic, Alan.

Director Forbes: And for --

President Brandon: Or is there anyone that would like to say anything about Alan before he gives us his words?

Director Forbes: Come up, and line up, team.

President Brandon: Come on up. Come on up.

Director Forbes: Alan, and you can find your speaking notes. [laughs]

Wendy Proctor: Hello, everybody. I'm Wendy Proctor. I'm the interim deputy director for engineering and previously senior architect. I was the one who had the pleasure of hiring Alan in 2008, [I'm going to say]. And in our working relationship, we learned a lot from each other and really grew together.

And in our partnership, we were able to perform a lot of the architectural work in house, which was not always the norm at the Port. So we were able to bring a lot of savings to the Port and use that savings for actually project funds. And we felt a lot of pride in that.

So in this, I would like to celebrate with Alan on the legacy that we have left for the Port and have been very proud to have worked with him all these years.

President Brandon: Thank you. [applause]

Alan Gin: Thank you, Wendy. Executive Director Forbes, President Brandon and Port commissioners, thank you for this recognition. My time working with the Port has been a blessing. I've worked on many meaningful design projects with very dedicated colleagues.

And I feel an incredible sense of pride being part of this agency that is committed to enhancing the quality of life and experience for everyone who visits the city's waterfront. Thank you again. Appreciate it.

President Brandon: Thank you. [applause] And congratulations again. Everyone? Yeah.

[photo taken] [applause]

Director Forbes: Thank you so much. Now, we would like to recognize David Hu. David has had a 17.5-year career at the Port and 28 years of combined service with the city at the Port and the Department of Building Inspection, also a very long, established career. Congratulations to you.

David brought a breadth of experience as a subject-matter expert as a mechanical engineer. He ensured practical and code-compliant solutions to his work at the Port. He successfully helped with implementing complex projects.

Of particular note are: the Pier 69 dry dock number one demolition project; Illinois Street Bridge utility rerouting project; the Port-wide energy-efficiency mechanical HVAC systems upgrade project; fire sprinkler system upgrade project; container crane demolition project; elevators and escalator-improvement projects; Round House 2 building HVAC upgrade project and the Beltline building; and waterfront restaurant sewer improvement projects -- quite a lot of very big utility work. Congratulations, David.

Thank you so much for helping to improve the health and safety and energy efficiency of our Port. And congratulations on your retirement.

President Brandon: Congratulations. [applause] Thank you. Come on up, David.

David Hu: I just want to thank you, Director Elaine and all the commissioners for the -- throughout the years and the hel -- gave me a lot of [help] and also our engineering division's management, like Wendy, Uday, etcetera. You know, throughout the years, they gave me a lot of [help]. That's why I can -- made some change with the Port. So I'm so grateful, very happy. Thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you. [applause]

Commissioner Adams: Picture.

Director Forbes: I'm sorry I'm making you get up and down. I know it's not the smartest way. [crosstalk]

[photo taken] [applause]

Director Forbes: Thank you, commissioners. For the final staff recognition, I'd like to recognize Dan Hodapp. Dan has had a long and productive career with the Port of San Francisco. Where are you, Dan. Okay. There you are. Thank you.

He began his career here in 1998. And he's been the Port's lead designer and has worked under 23 commissioners and three different executive directors. You're not to say who's your favorite ED. [laughter] Dan possesses a deep understanding of the Port's operation and public realm and has helped to guide new development and leasing for a variety of projects ranging from small to grand.

Dan's passion is to enhance the experience and draw of the waterfront so that it continues to be a notable attraction for locals and visitors. Along with enhancing the public realm, Dan has a passion for mentoring young professionals. He began the Port's design trainee internship, which has been hugely successful for both young professionals and the Port.

Dan led the Port on a number of planning engineering design projects including the 1997 waterfront plan design and access element, which guided Port design and historic preservation for over 25 years. He established and managed the city's waterfront design advisory committee.

He set up numerous design guidelines including the Embarcadero public realm design guidelines and signage guidelines and banner design guidelines and biodiversity guidelines. Dan's major projects helped shaped -- he helped shape include: the Hyde Street Harbor expansion; Pier 43 promenade, the cruise ship terminal, the Exploratorium, Piers 1 1/5, 3, 5, Ferry Building, Pier 14, Brannan Street Wharf, Mission Rock, Bayview gateway, the Port's wayfinding and public park programs. Whew.

That is a lot of work, Dan Hodapp. Thank you so much for all your years of service and the sacrifice you have made in advancing the evolution of the Port and the city's waterfront. Thank you so much, Dan.

President Brandon: Thank you, Dan. Thank you. [applause] So I know some of Dan's coworkers would like to say something before he speaks.

David Beaupre: Good afternoon, commissioners, David Beaupre, deputy direct of planning and environment, Dan and Executive Director Forbes. Dan, just wanted to take some time to appreciate the work you've done. I've worked with Dan for about two-thirds of his career here at the Port.

He's been a terrific colleague. I've not only been a colleague of his, but I've learned a lot from Dan about design. I know he has a strong passion for high design that attracts a variety of people to the waterfront. So we're going to miss Dan and his design ability, his ability to work with a variety of people and his goals. I wish him well in retirement. But I know he's going to come back and help us in the future. So thank you. Thank you very much, Dan. [laughter] [applause]

President Brandon: Would anybody else like to comment?

Director Forbes: Alice, you can come up.

Kathrin Moore: President Forbes, Director Brandon, my name is Kathrin Moore. And I have been a member of the waterfront design advisory for the past 21 years. And I'm joining everybody who is honoring Dan today. Most and foremost, I want to acknowledge Dan's exemplary role as a leader of the WDAC.

That is not an easy task, given that you have people with high opinions, each trying to make a point. But Dan has persevered. And all the projects that Director Forbes mentioned are a testimony of what Dan has achieved. Dan is a quiet force. What Dan has done for the Port and the San Francisco waterfront cannot be acknowledged simply by describing his leadership at the helm of the WDAC.

There is living proof out there that is evident in the beautifully consistent and high quality of our waterfront and the many parts that string the waterfront together. Dan comes with a high taste for design, as David Beaupre said.

And it is worth mentioning -- it is the depth of Dan as a professional, as a landscape architect that has guided and shaped the deliberations of the WDAC not only over the last 21 years but together with a large number of projects that have been planned, much debated, designed and completed during these two decades.

It was Dan's remarkable ability to always stay open to different viewpoints -- and different, they truly were -- and still find common ground that has created remarkable results. And Dan, throughout those years, you have touched, moved and inspired many of us. I speak for myself, but I know there are many who are not here today who would echo what I am saying.

You have practiced with purpose. And I want to thank you for being a colleague and a friend. Your handwriting in this chapter of the waterfront will always be known to those of us who had the privilege of working with you. And thank you for your service. [applause]

Phoenix Alfaro: Good afternoon, commissioners, and Port of San Francisco staff, my name is Phoenix Alfaro. And I am currently a planner in the capital and planning division at the San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department. But at one point in time, I was a planner here at -- or I was an intern here at the Port of San Francisco in the planning and environment department where I was fortunate enough to have Dan Hodapp as my supervisor.

I was 22 and had just moved from San Antonio, Texas to the Bay Area to receive my master's in city planning at Cal when I was invited for an interview at the Port. My interview panel consisted of Dan, Ming Yeung and David Beaupre. While I got many smiles and nods from Ming and David as I worked my way

through the interview questions, I remember Dan being stoic like a rock.
[laughter]

And quite frankly, I was feeling super intimidated. But little did I know that he would end up being one of the best supervisors and mentors I would have during my career. To this day, I always tell people about the first assignment I received from Dan.

He needed me to create paint specifications for the pier bulkheads along the Embarcadero. As someone who was studying planning and was expecting to do policy and data analysis work, I was trying to understand why I was assigned this task.

And if you've ever been given a task by Dan, you know how iterative his directive can be. You print him out a copy of your assignment. He'll get a red pen or marker, mark up your deliverables again and again until your work product is perfected. And this was the case with the paint specifications.

But he really challenged me to think about the layout and legibility of the drawings until it was perfected. And I like to tell people that this moment of my internship was like Mr. Miyagi teaching the Karate Kid to wax on, wax off [crosstalk] [laughter].

From these paint specifications, I began working on more complex projects such as developing community-engagement collateral for the Embarcadero seawall program, producing detailed yet easy-to-read maps for meetings with BCDC and, most notably, designing and laying out the 200-page waterfront plan.

Dan helped me cultivate an interest and talent in design that I didn't even know I had. And with these newly acquired skills, he helped me land jobs with several planning and design firms after I graduated. Now, as a planner in the rec and park department where I supervise interns, I do my best to embody the values that Dan was able to share with me during my time at the Port.

He always created a safe space and made me feel welcome to ask questions and not be afraid to make mistakes. I now strive to create a welcoming environment for our interns the same way he did for me. When I received the news that Dan was retiring, I texted the other interns I previously worked with.

We were all sad knowing that Dan would no longer be there to lead the internship program. But we couldn't help but to feel joy for him and be grateful that our careers overlapped. How many people can say their supervisor helped transform a waterfront that was one blocked off by a double-decker highway into a world-renowned destination full of parks and open space?

As Dan embarks on his well-deserved retirement, he leaves behind a legacy that will continue to inspire the next generations of planners and designers including myself. Dan, may your retirement be filled with countless bike rides and morning swims at USF but also relaxation, new adventures and time spent with loved ones. Congratulations, and best wishes for a happy and fulfilling retirement. [applause]

Diane Oshima: Good afternoon, President Brandon and members of the commission, Director Forbes and Dan. I'm Diane Oshima. And I guess I would like to just start by saying don't worry. Retirement is fantastic. The water is glorious. [laughter] Jump on in. I know from firsthand. I had the privilege of working with Dan for the entirety of his time at the Port.

And really, I'm so happy that Kathrin and Phoenix were preceding me because they really reflected the imprint that has a long-term effect on the future of this waterfront for all of the projects that Dan has shaped and developed along the way. Really, the waterfront-design-and-access element, to set the foundation of what the waterfront design should be, was so fundamental.

And all of his years devoted to that waterfront design advisory committee to ensure that the city, the Port, BCDC are all in the same conversation so that each project that has happened along the waterfront not only is beautiful and amazing but it contributes something more to the holistic experience that we all enjoy along the waterfront.

And I think that's really something that just is a forever thing. So Dan, thank you so much for all of the devotion to that. It's not an easy thing. But it comes from passion and heart that he has brought to the Port and the city all these years.

And if I could just, while I'm standing here, also give credit to Alan and David too because, when I looked at the Port Commission calendar, I found out these guys were on the retirement list as well. I was thinking I'm not going to recognize any of those names on the phone roster anymore. The turnover in the staff is amazing.

You know, both Alan and David also -- they -- I'm glad that you described, Elaine, many of their projects because just the title of the projects reflect the breadth of what happens behind the scenes. There's a lot of things that may not be that visible. And I think Alan and David worked on a lot of those projects.

But they're so essential to opening up and keeping the waterfront safe for everybody to enjoy. So I hope, to all three of you, you have the time of your lives in this next chapter. Thank you so much. [applause]

President Brandon: Thank you, Diane.

Alice Rogers: Good afternoon, President Brandon and commissioners, Director Forbes, Dan. I'm Alice Rogers, current president of the South Beach/Rincon/Mission Bay Neighborhood Association. And I've only glancingly had occasion to work with Dan. But I want to say that, each occasion, he always filled meetings with great grace notes.

But what I mostly want to say and wasn't listed in Director Forbes's copious listing of accomplishments is that Dan drives the meanest white board I have ever seen. [laughter] When he does public comments, it makes people really want to come up and speak out and say something interesting to see how it translates on the white board. [laughter]

So from now on, in your retirement, Dan, I hope you get to ride your bicycle with a little less weight on your shoulders. And I wish you well. Thank you. [applause]

President Brandon: Are there any other comments? Your turn.

Dan Hodapp: Director Forbes, President Brandon, members of the commission and David, for inviting every last friend I have [laughter] and convincing them to say such nice things, it's quite wonderful. You know, we all have choices about where we want to spend our time and often about where we want to work.

And I've been here a long time, as they've described. And what's kept me here for such a time is the culture of stewardship and collaboration that the Port has. When I say stewardship, it's taking care of these seven-and-a-half miles, this incredible resource that we all get to play with, we all get to help work on.

And it's maintenance, fixing roofs, fixing power outages, doing the landscape work in our public spaces. And it's keeping the waterfront clean and safe in so many ways. That's an example. It's engineering, evaluating facilities, finding creative solutions as to how we resolve all these problems in a port that's 160 years old and past its engineered design life by a lot.

It's real estate attracting the right tenants, doing new developments. And it's all the other departments -- I won't keep going on -- whether it's finance or the legal team, the resilience team -- you know so much about what they do -- the accounting people and the many roles of the planning and environment division all contributing to this stewardship, wanting to take care of this problem.

And all this happens because of collaboration. We don't work on projects by ourselves. Nobody does. I'd never accomplish anything by myself -- everyone wanting to work together to solve problems and be good stewards of this resource.

And the direction to do that starts at the commission. It starts with the executive director. It comes from our senior staff. And it translates down to

everyone in the organization, everyone you see here. It's a culture of collaboration, wanting to work together, wanting to meet with each other, wanting to solve problems together, wanting to -- knowing where their expertise and commitment is.

And that's a collaboration that I think has spilled over into other departments that we work with, whether it's MTA, Public Works, BCDC. I think we're a little contagious in our thrill of working here and how we do this. So it's inside and outside our walls.

I think you are conducting an agency that's a model for many others about how we operate, how efficient we are, how much we accomplish with a limited staff. And I just want to thank you for letting me be part of this for such a long time. [applause]

Director Forbes: Dan, if we could please take a photo with you.

President Brandon: Thank you, Dan.

[photo taken] [applause]

President Brandon: I just have to say that we have had three great people retire today. And the Port is really going to miss them. I have had the opportunity to work with Dan his entire time here at the Port. And I can't imagine the planning department without you.

You have worked on so many phenomenal projects and just brought -- connected the city to the waterfront and exceeded in our mission in bringing people to the waterfront because you were part of creating so many open spaces and so many beautiful things. And we're really going to miss you, Dan. Thank you.

Director Forbes: [For sure. We will.] [applause] Thank you, Madam President. That was really excellent that we were able to acknowledge three incredible employees today and incredible contributions. And contagious -- I'm going to use that, that we're contagious on collaboration.

Okay. So that leads me to the end. And I would like to acknowledge Commission Edward Harrington. Commissioner Harrington has served for a little over a year. And his term ends this month. In that year, he drew from a vast arena of expertise to advise on our balance sheet, the sole-source process, metrics for the Port's economic recovery, visionary resilience program and really, really much, much, much, much more.

In his work with the Port, he always demonstrated integrity, inquisitiveness and genuine care for those who live and work in the City and County of San

Francisco and enjoy our waterfront and to our staff. We extend our deepest appreciation for his invaluable contributions.

On a personal note, I just think you're one of the most brilliant minds and hearts of the city of a professional I've worked with. I won't go into stories. But I said some silly things to you when I was a young person analyst [laughter], and you didn't seem to hold it against me. And I don't think you held it against many people.

You actually saw to it that we had the training to be quality civil servants. And you always appreciated the value of a civil servant and held us in very high regard. And I experienced that my entire career. And thank you, Ed Harrington, for being such a model to me.

So I have no doubt that we will continue to be guided from what you brought to us here. And we just really want to thank you so much. We are so grateful to you. And we wish you well in your future endeavors. And I have a beautiful paperweight for you and flowers. And you also get a photograph. So please come up with the commissioners. [applause]

[photo taken] [applause]

President Brandon: Would anyone like to comment on Commissioner Harrington?

Michael Martin: Good afternoon, commissioners. Mike Martin. I'm the assistant Port director. Commissioner Harrington, our paths crossed a long time ago. I'm of a similar vintage as the executive director. And you were super kind to me as a super green deputy city attorney on several occasions.

But my most vivid memory before you came to the Port was when I was working at the SFPUC when you got the role as general manager there. And that was an agency that was kind of roiling in some controversy, had a lot in front of it in terms of a multibillion-dollar water-system retrofit.

And I remember -- I wasn't on senior staff. But I remember everybody looking around of like here comes Ed Harrington. Like what's it going to be like? And I was so struck at that time about how you were able to be empathetic to where we were as public employees but made us sort of realize the discipline and focus that was needed to deliver the mission that we had to deliver for the people of San Francisco.

And watching the tone you set just by coming in and being straight ahead, matter of fact, this is what we need to do is something that really embedded itself in me. And it's something that now I'm part of a senior staff. And I want to emulate that now with what we're doing at the Port on a smaller but still pretty cool scale.

So when I heard that you were going to be a Port commissioner, I had some trepidation -- I'll be honest [laughter] -- because you know encyclopedically how the city works, how the Port works, how we do the things we do. And so there isn't any magic we can do over here to sort of hide the ball and not get at what you want from us.

But from the first day you worked with us, I felt that same empathy for who we were as public employees, the importance of the mission and trying to be clear with us about how we can provide more information, how we can be more focused on things that aren't just in the approval that's in front of us and how we can deliver more for what we're doing with hopefully not too much more effort.

And it's just been great. And I really appreciate all you've contributed here at the Port. And I'm hopeful that I get another chance to cross paths from you and see what I can learn from this episode in the next episode. So all the best to you. Thank you very much. [applause]

Brad Benson: Commissioner Harrington, Brad Benson. I've been with the city for closing in on 26 years. And you've been in a leadership position for the city almost that whole time. And I think Elaine and Mike spoke well. I mean, you are brilliant. You get right to the heart of the matter.

And you bring an approach to problem solving that doesn't make people feel defensive about the problem that they're dealing with. You just are helpful in thinking through how to get to the other side of the problem. I'll recall one experience at the board before I talk about the resilience program.

So then Director of Public Finance Monique Moyer, came to Supervisor Ammiano concerned about the PUC's credit rating. There was a voter-approved rate freeze at the time on sewer rates. And Supervisor Ammiano thought immediately we need Ed Harrington to be part of the brain trust in terms of thinking about what to do about the problem.

And it wasn't an easy fix. It was asking voters to unfreeze rates. It was transferring the approval right for revenue bonds from voters to the commission and then setting up a capital structure to guide the programs that were needed on both the water and the sewer side. And that measure passed just by a hair. It never would have made the ballot without your wise advice at the time.

So that was my first upfront view of how you could help with that kind of problem solving and sort of getting everybody on the same page. I was thrilled when you were announced as a Port commissioner. We've always been lucky to have a great, really supportive commission.

But to have somebody who sat in the seat of building a large capital program, thinking through all the complexity of how to finance, permit, you know, scale up to a program like that -- and I just want to say, on behalf of the whole

resilience team, we always appreciate coming to the commission with our work, always appreciate the questions that you ask and the advice that you give us.

And we certainly are hopeful that we can stay in touch over time and draw on your wisdom going forward. So thank you so much.

Commissioner Harrington: Thanks, Brad. [applause]

President Brandon: Any other comments on Commissioner Harrington? Commissioners?

Commissioner Lee: Elaine, great report.

President Brandon: We're not at public comment yet.

Commissioner Lee: What are we d --

President Brandon: Believe it not, we haven't done public comment yet.

Commissioner Lee: Okay. I thought you were calling --

President Brandon: This -- Commissioner Harrington -- if you'd like to say anything about Commissioner --

Commissioner Lee: Oh. Well, I was going to do that in my closing. But --

President Brandon: Okay. You can wait if you want.

Commissioner Lee: I can wait. Do it all together.

Commissioner Adams: Yeah. I'd just like to say, Commissioner Harrington, it's been a pleasure working with you. You've been a superstar when you came to this commission. You raised the bar. And you kind of pushed us along like a tailwind. And Ed, there's something about you from the first time I met you. You have a majestic presence about you.

And to know, in my 12 years on the commission, that we have an ex-city controller -- you know how the city works, how to get things done, how to make things move in this direction, that direction. And you have those impulses. You know. You have the experience. You've sat in that seat.

And like I said, you offered so much. And then, the work that you've done in the community, the nonprofits, you've just -- you've been a stellar guy. And you've been like a hero because I think that you are someone that has committed your life and soul to the City and County of San Francisco.

And you brought those talents to the Port Commission. You jumped right in. You wasn't shy. You spoke truth to power. When you did, you added guidance. You add leadership. And I think you challenged all the commissioners to think and even the staff to think this way, think that way.

But you always had that kind of thinking, that your mind -- your mind is kind of like a genius. It's always moving. So I just want to personally say it to you. Thank you so much for being on this commission. I hope that you and I will stay in touch because, definitely, you have been a trailblazer in the city. But on this commission -- it's not how long you stay. It's what you did on the year or so that you were here. And clearly, you raised the bar for all of us. So I just want you to know, Ed. Thank you. [applause]

Vice President Gilman: I just want to say, Commissioner Harrington, I was so excited when I heard you were going to join. We had never met before. But as someone who's lived here since 1994 and ran a major nonprofit for almost two decades, you were infamous to all of us civilians moving through the world.

And you have had so much grace. You broke down complex situations. You've taught me a lot. And I do just want to say too, while I'm super excited about whoever our new commissioner will be, I do want to say this moment in time, we have -- outside of history of our tenures, we have someone steeped in business in the southeast waterfront. We have labor. We have small business. We have someone who's contracted as a nonprofit partner. And we have someone who's been a controller and been in that seat.

And I just think the complement of that breadth has made the commission really, really special this last year. And thank you so much for everything you've done to contribute to that. [applause]

President Brandon: I don't know what's left to say. [laughter] But I just want to say that, you know, I've known you over the years. And when I heard you had been appointed to the Port Commission, I was like, what a great choice and really looked forward to working with you.

And over this past year, I have learned so much from you. And you have contributed so much to the commission and to the staff. And it's just been really great and refreshing working with you on the resilience project, on so many other infrastructure projects and just really getting an understanding. And you just make it so clear and so easy for us all to come to a decision.

So you have been invaluable. And I have been honored to work with you. And we are going to miss you. Thank you. [applause]

Commissioner Harrington: Well, thank you very much. And obviously, I'm a flash in the pan compared to the three people that were up here a few minutes ago [laughter] in terms of Port experience. But it was a great year, you know, maybe

14 months. And I've enjoyed it so much. And so much of that is because this is a great commission.

Thank you very much, President Brandon. It has been wonderful working and getting to know at least some of the Port staff. So thank you, Elaine. Thank you, Mike and others. It's just been a great experience. I've enjoyed it. And things come, and things go in the city. I do think that there's so much before the Port.

There are so many challenges and successes waiting for you that I will be watching. And I will be hoping. And I will be sending you all my best wishes. And again, thanks for all the kind comments. I really wasn't expecting all that today. But anyway, thank you so much. [applause]

Director Forbes: Thank you, Madam President. That concludes my report.

President Brandon: Why, thank you. [laughter] We will now open it up to public comment. Is there any public comment on the executive director's report? Seeing none in the room, do we have anyone on the phone?

No Public Comment on the Executive Director's Report.

Commissioners' Discussion on the Executive Director's Report:

Commissioner Lee: Okay. Elaine, great report. Thank you for my little AAPI recognition. You know, I work hard for small business and the community. But what I really wanted to say to the retirees is part of the reason of coming to Port or requesting to come to Port was because of small business. But it's because of how the waterfront has been designed, how it's been engineered.

It's just amazing how this Port has become the world destination. It's because of the retirees today. And I just want to say thank you to the people that retired today. And of course, Commissioner Harrington, it's like -- I usually focus on one thing, you know, small business and what it takes to really operate a small business.

And you know, city government and all that was kind of all kind of thrown together to me. And I'm learning as I go. But Commissioner Harrington, when you joined us, it's like I'm waiting for you to say the -- [laughs] I'm listening to you on all these things. And I've learned so much about these projects and how to deal with them.

But the biggest thing is all the great gossip that you told me about [laughter] working with all these mayors and -- I mean, the stories -- it's crazy. But -- [laughter]

Commissioner Adams: Steve, Steve --

Commissioner Lee: But that's part of my -- that's part of learning. Right. I mean -- but thank you so much. I wish you luck. And people know me as the night-life guy. Come on. You've got to come down and have a cocktail with me. So thank you.

President Brandon: [laughs] Thank you. Commissioner Adams?

Commissioner Adams: Director Forbes, a stellar report. I want to thank all the work that went into Juneteenth along with you and President Brandon and all the good work that's happening here at the Port. And I think this is the boost in the arm that the city and county and even the waterfront needs as San Francisco, as we're recovering, you know, still from COVID, that people continue to see San Francisco as that bright light. And we're turning that corner. So I'm really impressed with the report. Thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you. Commissioner Harrington?

Commissioner Harrington: I've said enough. But happy Pride. Thank you for the Juneteenth event. And congratulations on the Heron's Head award and other things. And that's enough for me today.

President Brandon: Thank you. Vice President Gilman?

Vice President Gilman: Thank you. Director Forbes, amazing report. I mean, everything's been highlighted so much. And I just really want to say to all the staff in the room, each and every one of you contribute to this vibrant, safe waterfront, this seven-and-a-half miles of beauty.

It's the only commission I've ever wanted to serve on. I can see the waterfront from my block. And I just really want to thank all of you for being stewards. And I really also want to say -- I think Dan said it -- how we've set the example for collaboration and how we do our interworkings as a department as a small and mighty team.

And I really think, too, what I've been the most impressed with is how this department -- we have embraced equity. And everything in your report today from honoring Commissioner Lee to Juneteenth has been around equity. I did want to do one shout out because I think it's important because I think this also shows how we press our partners like the folks here who manage the Ferry Building.

So I did want to give a shout out to the newest restaurant that's opening in the Ferry Building that I hope all of you will come to called [Lunette's]. It is a Cambodian restaurant Chef Nite started in the [Oakville Fruitdale] district. And actually, as an immigrant, she started as an incubator at La [Concita] in the Mission.

And she's award winning, is one of the only Cambodian restaurants here in San Francisco. And this is a love letter to Cambodian food and to her heritage. She's been recognized by the New York Times and Bon Appetit. And we really hope that all of you will come out.

I'm not even sure it's open to the public yet. But it's here in the Ferry Building. And it shows a commitment to small businesses, BIPOC-led businesses from the folks who manage and run the Ferry Building. And I just wanted to welcome Chef Nite and, if I'm saying it right, Lunette's to the Ferry Building. Thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you. Who knew the executive director's report was going to take an hour? [laughter] And I don't want to repeat everything that's already been said but excellent report. Happy Pride Month to everyone, so happy that the Juneteenth on the Waterfront has become such a success and helped so many businesses grow.

Congratulations on the Heron's Head award. Congratulations to Commissioner Lee on his story, his piece. Great job. Congratulations again to Alan, David and Dan. And we wish you an amazing retirement. Thank you so much. Great report, Elaine. [applause] Next item, please.

10. CONSENT

- A. Request authorization to award one as-needed hazardous materials management and property restoration contract for over-water demolition, hazardous materials clean-up, and marine vessel salvage to Silverado Contractors. (Resolution 24-25)**
- B. Request authorization to amend the Harbor Traffic Code to establish on-street loading and other parking controls at Mission Rock. (Resolution 24-26)**
- C. Request approval to award a sole source grant in the amount of \$285,300 to Smithsonian Environmental Research Center for the Living Seawall Pilot Project to conduct monitoring and analysis, and to prepare a final report. (Resolution 24-27)**
- D. Approval of a no-fee License No. 17173 with Pacific Cruise Ship Terminals LLC for the periodic use of approximately 20,000 square feet of Pier 29 shed space for terminal worker parking during cruise calls at Pier 27 commencing on June 15, 2024 for a term of 21 months. (Resolution 24-28)**
- E. Request waiver of (1) Port of San Francisco commercial Salmon boats berthing fee for a period of five months (May 15, 2024, through October 15, 2024); and (2) Port of San Francisco Dungeness Crab pot storage**

fees for a period of five months (May 15, 2024, through October 15, 2024) in light of economic disruption caused by closure of the 2023 and 2024 commercial Salmon season and the multiple shortened commercial Dungeness Crab seasons. (Resolution 24-29)

- F. Request authorization for the Port Commission to receive delegation from the Board of Supervisors for the Port Commission to accept Mission Bay Parks improvements for Parks P19 and P22 (Bayfront Park) along Terry Francois Boulevard into the Port's Park system. Port Commission acceptance for maintenance and liability would be contingent upon the issuance of a Notice of Completion by the San Francisco Department of Public Works for the improvements, among other findings and prerequisites and approval of delegation for certain authority related to acceptance by the Board of Supervisors. (Resolution 24-30)**

ACTION: Port General Counsel proposed amendments to Item 10F. President Brandon removed Item 10F from the consent calendar for later discussion. Commissioner Adams moved approval of Items 10A through 10E of the consent calendar. Vice President Gilman seconded the motion.

Public Comment on the Consent Calendar:

Jeanette Caito: Good afternoon, President Brandon, commissioners and Executive Director Elaine Forbes. My name is Jeanette Caito. I'm with Caito Fisheries at Pier 45. We are a seafood processor. We buy the crabs -- Dungeness crabs and the salmon directly from the boats, and we process it.

We're located at Pier 45. Our plant is Pier 45 Shed B, number six and number seven. And we also have storage facilities at Shed A. We want to thank you for, over the years, the Port and Ms. Forbes has been so supportive of the seafood industry. And I'd like to thank you for that.

I mean, you helped us through COVID. You helped us through the 2016 crab relief plan. And I'm asking today to consider us for the crab and salmon relief fund. We store in Shed A crab equipment. And then, in our plant, we have a brine freezer. We have a compressor and a freezer.

It's worth about a million dollars. And we only allocate that for the crab season. And I'm here today to ask you if you would consider Caito Fisheries to be a part of the relief fund.

President Brandon: Thank you.

Jeanette Caito: Thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you.

Jeanette Caito: Thank you.

President Brandon: John Barnett?

John Burnett: Hi, commission. John Barnett, president of the Crab Boat Owners Association, own a couple of fishing boats at Fisherman's Wharf. Times are tough, no need to tell everybody that. And I just wanted to thank the Port for coming up with this relief package.

It's going to be needed. It's just one small part of our expenses. But every little bit helps. So I just wanted to come and voice that and say thank you, thank you, thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you.

Vice President Gilman: Thank you.

President Brandon: Lawrence?

Lawrence: Good afternoon, Director and commission. Thank you for the opportunity to address you today. My name is Larry Collins. And I'm president of the San Francisco Community Fishing Association, which is a co-op owned by about 25 local fishing families and their businesses. I and my wife also have a fishing boat, the Autumn Gale.

And we've fished out of the Port of San Francisco since '84. I'd like to thank you for recognizing that the local fishing fleet is facing unprecedented hardships brought on by gross mismanagement by -- for the salmon and crab fisheries by the federal government.

We used to fish salmon for five-and-a-half months and crab for six-and-a-half months. That was a full year of opportunity. And I like to tell people that we give the people that actually own the fish access to your resources. That's what our job is because you own the public-trust resource.

So now, these last couple years, this year and last year, we've been reduced to three months of crab fishing. The boat payments, the insurance, the maintenance and the permits are all the same as if we fish for a full 12 months. So we're relieved and thankful that our local government partners have stepped up to keep this fleet alive. Thank you again. You guys have helped us a lot in the past. Thank you again.

President Brandon: Thank you. Is there any other public comment? Do we have anyone on the phone?

Operator: There are no callers for public comment at this time.

President Brandon: Okay. So I would like to recommend, regarding 10E, if we could look at including the processors and the fishermen, all those involved in the crab season and bring that back to the commission.

President Brandon: All in favor [for Items 10A though 10E]?

All Commissioners were in favor.

President Brandon: Any opposed? Resolutions 24-25, 24-26 24-27, 24-28 and 24-29 have been approved.

Jenica Liu: Okay. 10F requests authorization for the Port Commission to receive delegation from the Board of Supervisors for the Port Commission to accept Mission Bay Parks improvements for Parks P19 and P22 (Bayfront Park) along Terry Francois Boulevard into the Port's Park system. Port Commission acceptance for maintenance and liability would be contingent upon the issuance of a Notice of Completion by the San Francisco Department of Public Works for the improvements, among other findings and prerequisites and approval of delegation for certain authority related to acceptance by the Board of Supervisors. Resolution 24-30.

Michelle Sexton: Thank you, Jenica. So commissioners, this item has been before you before. This is with respect to Port parks that you're receiving from OCII, Parks 19 and 22. David Beaupre is here to address any comments or questions you might have about this matter. But I'd like to read into the record the revisions that we've been requested -- where we're asking you to make. This is going to not be quite as long as your report. [laughter] But there are new clauses -- new clauses nine to 12, I believe you have before you.

Those in the audience, they are also in print. And there are four new whereas clauses and, I believe, six new resolves. So let me just quickly read that. You can follow along.

Whereas park P22 also contains two linear parcels on the eastern edge of the park adjacent to Terry Francois Boulevard, which are identified as assessor parcel block numbers 8721-014 Lot 14 and 8722-020 Parcel C and --

Whereas the city will acquire these parcels at the time P22 is accepted. And eventually, these parcels will be merged into the park, be subject to Port jurisdiction and --

Whereas OCII in a letter dated May 6, 2024 found that the city actions related to acceptance of Parks P22 and P19 are consistent with the Mission Bay South redevelopment plan and --

Whereas the planning department, in a letter dated June 3, 2024 found that the city actions related to acceptance of Parks P22 and P19 are within the

scope of the CEQA analysis of the Mission Bay South redevelopment plan and on balance consistent with the city general plan and the [eight] priority policies of Planning Code Section 101.1.

And that concludes the whereases. There are now six resolves that are added, resolved clauses numbers two through the eight in the resolution. Resolved -- I read that wrong. I'm sorry -- resolved clauses one through seven in the resolution.

Resolved, the Port Commission relies on the Planning Department letter for CEQA purposes and adopts the environmental findings [at the zone].

And be it further resolved, the Port Commission recommends that the Board of Supervisors acknowledge that the Port Commission will, one, accept ownership of the park improvements as acquisition facilities on behalf of the city when Public Works determines that such improvements have been: constructed in accordance with the approved plan and specifications under the applicable permits and all applicable city codes, regulations and standards and such improvements are ready for their intended use; two, dedicate the park improvements to public use; three, designate the property on which the Port improvements are located for park and/or open-space purposes; and four, upon their completion, accept park improvements for Port Commission maintenance and liability.

And be it further resolves that the Port Commission recommends that the Board of Supervisors delegate to the Port Commission for a period of three years the board's power to: one, accept ownership of the park improvements as acquisition facilities on behalf of the city; two, dedicate such park improvements to public use; three, designate the property in which the park improvements are located for park and/or open-space purposes; and four, take all other official actions necessary for or related to acceptance of the park improvements including, without limitation, accepting the park improvements for Port Commission maintenance and liability and accepting conditional assignment of all warranties and guarantees related to the construction of park improvements.

And be it resolved the Port Commission acceptance actions for Parks P22 and P19 shall specifically exclude assets in those parks that the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission will own and maintain.

And be it further resolved the Port Commission agrees to accept Lot 14 and Parcel C as part of the Park 22 and under Port jurisdiction after the Board of Supervisors approves grant deed for Lot 14 and the city's real estate director approves the grant deed for Parcel C after the Port Commission accepts Park P22.

And be it resolved the Port Commission directs the executive director to work with the San Francisco Public Works director to ensure that all findings,

decisions and procedures associated with acceptance of parks in Mission Bay that would be followed as part of the Board of Supervisors' acceptance action are taken in regard to the Port Commission's acceptance of Parks P22 and P19.

And be it further -- that concludes the revisions.

ACTION: Vice President Gilman moved approval of Item 10F as amended. Commissioner Adams seconded the motion.

No Public Comment on Item 10F.

Commissioner Harrington: I just wanted to clarify. On E, did you say that, during new business, you were going to add or ask the staff to do a new one so that people in the audience know what that is.

President Brandon: Ask the staff to explore including everyone.

Commissioner Harrington: Including the processors?

Vice President Gilman: Mm-hmm.

President Brandon: Including the processors. Yes.

Commissioner Harrington: Okay.

President Brandon: Are there any questions on this item? If not, all in favor?

All Commissioners were in favor.

President Brandon: Resolution 24-30 has been approved. Next item, please.

11. FINANCE & ADMINISTRATION

A. Informational presentation regarding proposed Little Embarcadero Activation Project and possible action to amend the Port's sole source grant to the Fisherman's Wharf Community Benefits District to reallocate \$400,000 from the existing budget and increase the not-to-exceed amount by \$1,032,200, all for the Little Embarcadero Activation Project. (Resolution 24-31)

Michael Martin: Good afternoon, President Brandon, Vice President Gilman and commissioners. My name is Michael Martin. I am the assistant Port director. I wanted to say a few words about the item before you, which is sort of the next phase in our effort to work with the Fisherman's Wharf Community Benefit District to activate Fisherman's Wharf and sort of continue on its recovery from the pandemic.

The item before you -- I really wanted to sort of put some context around it because, to me, it's very akin to what we're seeing -- the strategy the city is pursuing in some other areas of the city. And it really reflects, I think, a sort of similar evolution that we've been feeling about this project, which is, you know, we sort of -- I think the city has done a lot to stabilize the clean, safe and vibrance not only of the Port but the city in terms of law enforcement, in terms of keeping people safe coming out of the pandemic.

And what we've found in the city elsewhere is that we can't sort of rely on our historic attraction anymore because of the change dynamics of things like the office market or where people come on the natural to sort of enjoy the City of San Francisco. So you're seeing a number of places such as Front Street over here, where they're trying to establish the first entertainment district under the new state law, trying to sort of create new attractions to counteract the dropping office-worker population downtown and sort of use that to spur visitation and spur the regrowth of retail.

Similarly, you're seeing today the stories in the paper about the somewhat larger proposed makeover for the cable car turnaround on Powell Street, again taking something that is already attraction and trying to make it where people want to stay even longer. And hopefully, that sort of has knock-on effects to the retail nearby.

So at Fisherman's Wharf, I think what we've seen is a lot of positive progress on trying to manage the sidewalks towards addressing the unpermitted vending challenges. And I want to thank our security manager, Kyle Thomas, the San Francisco Police Department and our police detail and the Department of Public Works for their collaboration in trying to create that sort of more managed environment.

And now, what we'd like to talk to you about now is what we want to do to have more attraction, so people stick there so that we attract more people past Pier 41 to sort of come down towards the western end of Fisherman's Wharf to our businesses that there now and the businesses that we want to reestablish in some of those darker storefronts.

So I mean, I just wanted to frame that because it seems like we're sort of doubling down. But it's also, I think, a change in a focus strategy and something that we can move quickly and nimbly to try to see what works and what doesn't. So with that, I'd like to hand it off to Meghan Wallace, our economic recovery manager, to begin the presentation. Thank you.

Meghan Wallace: Thank you, Mike. Good afternoon, President Brandon, commissioners, Director Forbes. As Mike just introduced, I'm Meghan Wallace, the Port's economic recovery manager. And I'm here today to provide an informational presentation and seek potential approval of a request to amend the Port's grant to the Fisherman's Wharf Community Benefit District, or Fisherman's

Wharf CBD, so that they may deliver on a new initiative called the Little Embarcadero activation project.

I will point out that my project partner, Julie Flynn from Street Plans, will be helping me present today. My colleague, Amy Cohen, the Port's business-generation manager is also here to help answer questions as are representatives from the Fisherman's Wharf CBD. We have Randall Scott, Kaitlin Thresher and Cecile Gregoire here to support. Alysabeth Alexander-Tut is here to answer any more technical questions around the grant.

So to begin, just want to remind the commission as well as the public that, about a year ago, staff came to the Port Commission and sought approval to award a \$2.2 million grant to the Fisherman's Wharf CBD for a two-year program to develop and implement a multi-faceted public-space activation and stewardship program in Fisherman's Wharf.

While this was a significant investment, it was directly in line with the Port's strategies for targeted activations particularly by aiming to rebuild a durable visitor base that supports our current tenants and would create attractions to bring in new tenants to fill in vacant spaces and potentially attract developers and future investment in the wharf. So it really was a very strong strategic investment.

And today, we are looking to increase the funding for the Fisherman's Wharf CBD really for a \$1.4 million first-year program for the Little Embarcadero activation. And we're looking to do that by reallocating \$400,000 of their existing grant and increasing their not-to-exceed amount by \$1,032,200.

And the item before you today in terms of our informational overview will give a little bit of a look back on the CBD's accomplishments to date. Ms. Flynn will give an overview of the proposed project. And then, I'll go into a little bit more detail about the grant amendment.

So looking at the Fisherman's Wharf CBD accomplishments to date, I really want to highlight the Fisherman's Wharf is clean and safe. They have been dedicating ambassadors to helping maintain the area above and beyond, really trying to make sure that trash is cleaned up, graffiti and stickers and cleared and just overall make it shiny, spic and span and welcoming.

And of course, the added layer of support that the ambassadors provide is providing hospitality services, really making sure that visitors coming through the wharf feel welcome, can receive direction and overall just feeling like it is a clean and safe place to be.

And then, on top of that, we really get to enhance that experience with activation and beautification. And in that regard, the CBD really has been shining over the last year. In particular, they helped put on -- or they organized bringing

in a production called [Trolley Dancers] for a three-day event, free to the public, really celebrated the unique characteristics of Fisherman's Wharf.

And then, of course, Pier Party, which has been a very successful event. In 2023, they put on 19 shows. And within that, 17,000 unique visitors attended the wharf during that time with an average dwell time of 45 minutes. And this year is looking to be even more successful just with the three events that have been put on so far this year -- three out of the 20 that are planned.

We've already had over 5,000 unique visitors for these events with 48 minutes of dwell time. So we're really seeing that Pier Party has been activating the area. We have heard positive feedback from our tenants that, during these events, they are seeing upticks in sales.

So we are feeling positive outcomes directly from these events and then, of course, features like hanging flower baskets, installing beautiful murals such as in Crab Wheel Plaza, you know, featuring regional marine animals and other life and then a dedication to the wharf's fishers on Jefferson Street.

And overall, we've been receiving wonderful community feedback and have been directly engaging with our tenants and other stakeholders in the wharf and have heard nothing but positive feedback about this investment and commitment.

But looking ahead, we are hoping to take on a new focus to the Little Embarcadero. And this really came from conversations with our tenants, other stakeholders in the area, recognizing that, despite the wonderful work of the CBD over this last year, the Little Embarcadero has been a challenge.

You know, as Mr. Martin just referred to, the unpermitted vendors -- it really has been a challenge for our tenants and sort of bringing down the overall liveliness and fun that we're trying to convey in the wharf. And the solution the Port along with the CBD came to was to work with Street Plans and Urban Design -- planning and design firm to really create a positive activation in the area through a near-term public-space project that we're calling the Little Embarcadero activation project.

And maybe just to highlight some of the key outcomes that we're looking for from this work, again thinking about vending enforcement, complementing that enforcement activity with the positive activations, literally taking up space with our beautification and activation work.

We do want to offer new draws to locals and visitors. This is an overarching strategy that we have been pursuing in the wharf. And we see the Little Embarcadero and the promenade as a wonderful place to create a new draw.

We want free and affordable activities for kids and families and, of course, as referred to previously, thinking about that movement of visitors between other major milestone markers within that region of Ghirardelli Square and Pier 39, drawing people in and engaging them and getting them to stay.

But I think another important element of this is thinking that we're testing our concepts that can be a prototype for other activation projects not just in Fisherman's Wharf but also thinking in other areas like into the southern waterfront when we're thinking about activating and using the southern waterfront beautification funding.

This is a test case that can be applied both in the wharf in the future and these other wonderful areas along the waterfront. So with that, I'm going to actually hand it over to Julie Flynn. And she's going to walk you through the project details.

Julie Flynn: Great Thank you, Meghan. And good afternoon, Executive Director Forbes and commissioners. Meghan, I had to take it back for one last objective of this slide that felt really important to me in segueing into the design I'm going to walk you through, which is the last one, which said, "Be action oriented."

This is something we heard really loud and clear from local business stakeholders. And the line that sticks in my mind -- I'm forgetting who said it -- but was that the people who come and visit Fisherman's Wharf this year are the word-of-mouth ambassadors for next year's tourists.

And it was really important that we bring something to the table that was going to delight people and be really positive and that we do it this summer. So that was just a really important kind of framing point for what you're going to see today.

So what you're looking at is the sidewalk that is shown here on the bottom. And this is a rendering to show some conceptual ideas. This is what we're calling the -- it's a promenade. We're kind of creating an inviting promenade, reusing some existing materials, the benches and some of the planters there, but adding something to really elevate this visually.

The wooden structures allow you to see the view. They're pergolas. But I draw your attention to the image on the upper right because there's a real gateway effect. It's begging you to walk down and enjoy the view and sort of see what is going to carry over to the other side.

So that's kind of one of our main focus areas, this kind of promenade, using some of what's there but bringing in greenery, you know, plants. Some of the other things we really heard from people about this space is that, as many amenities as there are with the SkyStar Wheel being a new one, it feels very gray and windy.

So we were really trying to think about how we could humanize and kind of make it feel a little more welcoming. With that promenade as a key anchoring point, we really have a toolkit of elements that can be deployed throughout to bring this spirit of playful nautical activation so movable tables and chairs, colorful seating, of course but also really trying to be playful with the seating.

Many of us may have seen those spinny chairs at the Tunnel Tops Park. They're very popular. We'll bring some of those in. The pergolas mentioned and shown on the rendering can be a house for seating, vending, other types of activations.

We really see a huge opportunity to bring color to the space with a captivating mural. I'll show in a few slides kind of how we envision that coming together. Another big important move here is the introduction of kiosks, really tying with this -- you know, kind of creating not only more amenities for people but economic opportunities as well for the businesses in those kiosks and then some of the planters and programming that we've talked about a little bit here.

I want to dive into the containers for a moment. And you're seeing the image on the top. This is a different view of the space from the plaza we're calling the welcome plaza. When you're walking to this site, this is kind of where you hit and where you're wondering, where do I go? What do I do next?

We have placed a small kiosk there that we think could be a great opportunity for a kind of a welcoming ambassador kind of orienting-type use. But generally, you know, the idea with the container kiosk is that they would be a site for up to four local businesses to operate short-term activations with special consideration to Port and Fisherman's Wharf tenants today.

The applications for these close this week. And I think the group is really excited about who responded, which is really great. So the containers therefore serve as sort of an infrastructure for vending, programming but also a canvas. And if you see that image at the bottom, you know, what's shown in the rendering is the blue, in which color they'd arrive. It's sort of the base coat.

But it's really an amazing opportunity to bring more color and use those structures as a canvas for art in addition to the local businesses and programming inside.

This plan view just sort of gives you a zoomed-up view of kind of the different activation nodes and how they might interact. So that welcome plaza I just mentioned -- that's number one. The other big focus areas are number three, the promenade that was shown in that other rendering. And then, four and five are on either side of the Franciscan restaurant, really trying to encourage people to circle through the site.

Not numbered here but also really important for Fisherman's Wharf CBD is the Crab Wheel Plaza and all the activation they've done there around Pier Party that Meghan mentioned. So this is just another view of that welcome plaza. You can see the kiosk there with movable tables and chairs.

And it's important to mention the kind of preservation of the performer sites that are there today because they're an awesome activation that could be continued to be leveraged and celebrated. The waterfront promenade -- I want to draw your attention to one thing here which is the blue boxes, two and three, are the kiosks.

And I want to just show the kind of adjacency to the promenade. So the kind of human experience of that is that, if you were to get something -- say a grab-and-go food option or something else from this kiosk, you're then able to just enjoy walking down that promenade. And sit on the seats. Take in the water. Promenade through.

The other big pieces on either side of the Franciscan is the introduction of that playful furniture. This is another color pop. We want to invite people to linger and stay, take a photo, be silly with their family or their partner or whoever they've chosen to explore the waterfront with today and go back and tell their friends about it for next year.

The last item I mentioned is kind of opportunity for color being an [unintelligible] mural. So the idea here is using ecofriendly, non-slip paints, creating murals that really center around the kiosk so using the vertical and horizontal surfaces. Those photos on the bottom right kind of show the optical potential there, something that got up a wall and onto the ground.

The exact details have not been designed. But it's something we're really excited to dig into this summer as an opportunity to engage artists and artist communities across San Francisco in co-creating this space. So I'll just pause for a second because everything I've shown to date is sort of the what. It's the what you see rolled out this summer.

And I would just say that that's sort of the tip of the iceberg above the water. But the kind of bigger piece below it is the people power, the people who are vending in the kiosks, the artists who are painting the murals and, of course, the extremely important management model to kind of make it all work, to bring the tables and chairs out, to make sure that they are clean and really inviting day after day after day.

And you know, I would say that, when we look across the country at kind of activations of this scale that are successful, that hyper-local management is so critical to making it work and sort of having dedicated team of people that can really dial in and address issues on the ground.

I think it's also going to be critical to making sure that anyone who has been selected through the RFP to fill the kiosk has a great experience, you know, be they an existing Port tenant or someone new and that there's someone there to make sure the space around the kiosk that they've chosen to operate in just looks and feels awesome.

So we're really excited about the project. And I hope that gives you a little bit of a flavor of what's to come. Meghan?

Meghan Wallace: All right. And then, to really get into the details of the grant amendment, I mean, maybe building off of what Julie just shared, the fact is that we are already in a grant with the Fisherman's Wharf CBD. They have demonstrated the ability to operate in other ways in the area.

And frankly, we've got a really strong partner who is ready to go and carry forward with this first year of implementation on the Little Embarcadero activation project. So staff is proposing that we move forward with amending the grant for the CBD.

Again, the total first-year cost is \$1.4 million. You know, a portion of that is for the one-time startup costs of buying materials and doing all of those installations with pergolas and seating and containers. But actually, the bulk of that really is tied to the labor and personnel costs of ambassadors and staff who are operating out on the site.

So in order to move forward with amending the grant, we are proposing reallocating \$400,000 of previously approved funds that would have otherwise gone to activities like additional hanging flower baskets, activating closer to the cruise terminal. Those are some of the bigger ones where, instead, we're going to focus and dial those activities and efforts in at the Little Embarcadero project.

But we do still need additional resources in the grant. So we're proposing to increase the not-to-exceed amount by just over a million dollars. And we have identified additional stimulus funds as well as a previously approved Port project that was really focused on planning both for real estate and resilience purposes in Fisherman's Wharf that we would propose applying to this project.

Due to the nature of the Fisherman's Wharf CBD grant having been a sole-source grant for two years, we're really locked into that term. So to the extent that we are able to demonstrate positive outcomes from this work and want to continue into a second year, staff is proposing that we return to the commission in a future date and really lay out a proposal in terms of a new request-for-proposals process and funding.

So this request today really is tied to that first year of operation. For next steps, just we are going to request your approval of this item. And if approved, we are looking to begin installing all of the materials out at the Little

Embarcadero. Actually, as an important update, due to the timeline of procurement, we're looking at early July instead of the end of June.

So that first bullet here is actually incorrect. It's not -- we don't want you walking out there the week of June 24th wondering, where is everything? It's looking more like the second week of July. Just simply, that's how long it's taking to get the containers, in particular, installed.

But from that point of installation, we would begin the pop-up program in August and then the ground and container murals would roll out in September. And then, just in terms of our permitting, we will need to return to BCDC in January of 2025.

And then, of course, in terms of us wanting to continue into a second year, staff will return to the commission. So really just in terms -- I want to give a closing thought that this work really is central to our economic-recovery work. We have an objective tied to targeted activation of Fisherman's Wharf.

Through all of our stakeholder engagement including working with Fisherman's Wharf advisory committee, meeting directly with tenants, we've just had a really broad array of engagement with our stakeholders.

And I feel very strongly that this is a direct response to their input and what they're asking for and, frankly, a way to really elevate that experience in Fisherman's Wharf and prepare us for being able to fill vacant leaseholds and hopefully attract future investment in Fisherman's Wharf as well. So thank you for your attention. We look forward to your questions.

President Brandon: Thank you. Can I have a motion?

ACTION: Commissioner Adams moved approval of the resolution. Vice President Gilman seconded the motion.

Public Comment on Item 11A:

Taryn Hoppe: Hi, commission. Hi, Ms. Forbes. I am a Port tenant actually, retail and restaurant tenant. Our family has been in business down there since I was born -- since before I was born. And I'm also a board member on the CBD. So I'm very intimately familiar with the work they've been doing.

And it's really impressive. And it's a really good team they have right now. I just want to voice my support for extending the grant money and the reallocation because I couldn't think of a better way to give the wharf a shot in the arm right now than projects like these that can be done so efficiently and quickly.

And I just can't tell you how sorely it's needed. You know, this summer's numbers are not looking great. We all thought, you know, we'd just be on the up

and up since COVID ended. And it's not that way. So these are the kind of things that we need and work like this from people who care. And I just really appreciate everyone's work. And I hope this gets done. Thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you. Darlene Plumtree?

Darlene Plumtree: Good afternoon, President Brandon, commissioners and Director Forbes. My name is Darlene Plumtree. I'm the chief executive officer at the San Francisco Maritime National Park Association. I'm also the co-chair of the Fisherman's Wharf advisory committee.

And I am here today to ask you and to encourage you to approve the reallocation of funds for the Little Embarcadero activation project. Fisherman's Wharf is desperately in need of beautification and activation. It really needs to be interesting, fun and inviting.

The Fisherman's Wharf CBD has been doing a wonderful job to support the tenants and improve the quality of the wharf area with the flower baskets, the pier parties and the ambassador program. But we need more. And we need it soon. I know that the CBD team has some great plans, as we've seen here today.

And we'll work very hard to keep Fisherman's Wharf a number-one place to visit in San Francisco. I ask you to please approve the grant amendment. And thank you for your consideration.

President Brandon: Thank you. Paul Miller?

Paul Miller: Good afternoon, commissioners. My name is Paul Miller, vice president of operations for Boudin Bakery. Boudin fully supports the Little Embarcadero activation, as proposed by the CBD. We have seen foot traffic decrease significantly over the past two years, as unpermitted vendors have taken over most of the sidewalks on the Little Embarcadero and Jefferson Street.

As visitors approach Powell Street from Pier 39, they often turn around as the current scenery is not welcoming. We believe the activations in step is in the right direction to enhance the visitor experience and increase the dwell and walking time for our visitors. Thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you. Sina?

Sina von Reitzenstein: Good afternoon. My name is Sina von Reitzenstein. And on behalf of Pier 39 and Blue and Gold Fleet at Pier 41 and as a Fisherman's Wharf Community Benefit District member of the board, I would like to thank you all for your attention to and understanding of the current needs of Fisherman's Wharf, specifically for your approval last year of the grant to improve

the Fisherman's Wharf area. What a difference it's made. And we really appreciate it.

The activation and improvements afforded by this grant so far have been positive proof that activation can greatly enhance an area to create an engaging and vibrant destination. This grant has already made a significant positive impact by making the heart of Fisherman's Wharf a more attractive, enjoyable and safe experience for locals and tourists alike.

Please approve the additional grant funding request before you today for the Little Embarcadero area to ensure that the huge strides that have been made in the district are continued and the Little Embarcadero area can be returned to our visitors and also flourish as a vibrant, clean, safe and accessible waterfront destination that is free of unpermitted vendors including illegal alcohol and drug sales. Thank you so much.

President Brandon: Thank you. Is there any other public comment in the room? Come on up.

Tyler Foster: I waited this long. I'm going to get my comment in. Good afternoon, President Brandon, commissioners, Executive Director Forbes. My name is Tyler Foster. I'm one of the owners of the Red and White Fleet. We are a family-owned company that's been operating on the Bay for over 130 years.

I, too, am here to voice my support for this expenditure. We think it hits on three key themes that are important in the wharf right now: the first, beautification -- you've heard about that. Especially with a lot of the empty storefronts, anything we can do to make it more attractive to visitors is very welcome.

The second is safety. Having it more activated, having more lights, having more people and more activity will contribute to the safety of the area. And then, finally, deterrence -- I think the pergolas especially will create an environment that, in addition to being attractive and safe, will also deter a lot of the illegal vending we've been seeing. So for all those reasons, we hope you'll consider this investment. Thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you. Any other public comment in the room?

Kaitlin Thresher: Hi. Good afternoon, commissioners and Director Forbes. I'm Kaitlin, the director of marketing for the FWCBD. But I am speaking on behalf of Dante Serafini, who owns the Franciscan, which is the heart of the program that we are proposing.

And he says, "The Little Embarcadero has taken over for the past several years with illegal vending, visible homelessness and the after effects of both. Filthy sidewalks and out-of-control vendor parking has made it undesirable as a walking and visiting area.

"The CBD has offered a temporary solution starting this summer. And this has been the first and only effort to improve the most visible area of Fisherman's Wharf. Unless someone has a better solution, we strongly recommend the Port to support these efforts. Thank you."

President Brandon: Thank you. Any other public comment in the room? Seeing none. Do we have anyone on the phone?

Operator: Yes. There is one caller for public comment. Opening the first line.

President Brandon: Thank you.

Julia Rome: Good evening, commissioners and Director Forbes. I'm Julia Rome, director of public policy and executive programs for San Francisco Travel. I'm pleased to express our support for the funding of the Little Embarcadero activation project.

As you've heard today, the Fisherman's Wharf CBD has done a wonderful job of maintaining a clean and vibrant waterfront through its ambassador programs, beautification efforts such as its murals, flower baskets and lighting, amazing events and marketing over social media and in the press.

This work is critical for maintaining visitor interest and attracting new tenants to vacant shopfronts that support foot traffic to these small businesses. To continue the positive trajectory of the area, the Little Embarcadero is in need of focused attention due to the presence of unpermitted street vendors that tend to disrupt the flow of foot traffic to our nearby businesses and negatively impacts the visitor experience along Fisherman's Wharf.

We believe that increased efforts to generate positive activities and beautification are critical to continue to improve public realm in this jewel of our city. The Little Embarcadero project will create a positive use of the promenade resulting in increased foot traffic and excitement among visitors and residents. We hope you will support the additional funding for this crucial project. Thank you all for your time.

President Brandon: Thank you. Any other callers?

Operator: There are no other callers for public comment at this time.

President Brandon: Thank you. Public comment is closed. Commissioner Lee?

Commissioners' Discussion on Item 11A:

Commissioner Lee: Definitely, I mean, I'm in support of this increase. But I have a few comments. So your stewardess assistants -- two-thirds of your budget is going to that, which is well needed. But I'm noticing on your description here -- I

don't see any results from engaging the illegal vendors or some of the homeless issues or stuff, whether or not -- you know, what's being done or at least pointing them in to some kind of direction other than obviously expanding the program and taking the space.

But you realize that, even if you build these beautifications, you know, without the proper use of the steward -- assistants, you know, they're just going to keep coming back. So I would like to actually see what the stewardess are doing to address the illegal-vendor situation because it's not fair for the people that are actually paying their permits and the small businesses that are along the thing that are still struggling because of this situation.

Now, I know it's a difficult thing. But if we're spending two-thirds of the budget to be part of the stewardess program to help mitigate this, besides taking up space, I'd like to know, you know, what you guys are doing to help with that. So that's one thing.

The other thing is promotion. Your budget is only \$110,000 allocated to promotions. The thing is -- and I'll give you an example. Like Chinatown is a destination location. And we've cleaned it up. We've activated and everything. But we don't have foot traffic -- same thing.

We don't have enough people coming. And we try to promote. We use Facebook, Instagram, whatever. But again, if the CBD has a website, Facebook, Instagram, somebody that's allocated to really promote this thing not just on the weekends and the parties but every day, you know, Monday, Wednesday, you know, Tuesday, Thursday -- the weekdays because, you know, you're paying your rent. You still have to stay open, but there's no traffic.

So I understand to promote the concerts and things, which in my opinion -- because I only really saw a few of the promotions for the upcoming concerts -- I think more can be done, maybe a little bit more money allocated to promotions. But that's basically my opinion about how things are allocated because I'm -- you know, we're kind of going through it in another district.

And everybody knows around the world to come to Fisherman's Wharf, same as Chinatown. But again, without foot traffic or people knowing how beautiful it's going to be or what programs you have, you're still going to be slow. So no matter how much money you pour into it, without the proper promotion -- and even like highlight that you have patrols or walking ambassadors going around because people still are a little bit apprehensive whether or not they still feel safe coming out.

So I think more work with SF Travel, maybe more videos they can share with escorts, or they could see people roaming and talking to people and tourists -- I think that may help relieve some of the confidence -- or unconfidence of people not wanting to come to Fisherman's Wharf or Chinatown or whatever.

And that's what we're trying to do in another district. I think that, if the CBD can focus on that, then this program should be a lot more successful. And I think the activation of the Embarcadero is a perfect idea. But it's only kind of maybe a half-ass solution.

You've really got to get your people engaged to let people know it is safe to come out not just on the weekends but on a Wednesday and a Thursday. So that's kind of my point on that. But I support this increase of budget.

President Brandon: Thank you. Commissioner Harrington?

Commissioner Harrington: Thank you, Madam President. Actually, again, I support this. I think it's a great idea. As Commissioner Lee said, ask for more. I think that's the only thing I would suggest is -- I noticed that your marketing was going down. And also the outdoor events and storefront activations was actually going down from the original budget.

So if there's something about that that you need more in some fashion or if there's something that's not working, I would encourage you to come back and tell us what that might be. But where you're going I think is great.

President Brandon: Thank you. Commissioner --

Commissioner Adams: Adams. Yeah. Yeah. I agree with Commissioner Lee. There's a lot of questions that he brought out. But I'm favor of this. I think the commission must act. But we must do it in a responsible manner. And I've said this at many commission meetings. I still think we have an image problem in this city about whether it's safe on Fisherman's Wharf.

And once there's an issue, you need to talk about it and address it. And I think that's the responsibility of the commission. And I think whatever the commission can do -- we want people to feel safe, embrace coming down to Fisherman's Wharf.

And whether it's police presence, the steward assistants -- and I agree with Commissioner Lee. Ask for more money. We want to make this work. One thing I heard in here was unity. Everybody's rowing in the same direction. How do we get there? I don't have a lot of the answers.

But one thing I do know is, you know, especially with Commissioner Lee -- he's been doing this for a long time. And he understands a lot of this. So I think we need to do what we need to do. We all need to pull together and get more money. And let's see the results.

And if we get the mayor down there -- whoever we need to get down there, let's run that kind of campaign to say that we've taken our city back over.

We've taken Fisherman's Wharf back over. It's our place. You're talking about a city one time used to have 30 million tourists a year.

And people have got to know all around the globe that it's safe to come. And when you hear the news sometimes, you hear things that it ain't safe to come to San Francisco or Oakland. And we don't want that. We want to embrace it. And we have to talk about it.

And we need to get this thing on fire. We want it to be contagious and put that energy back down there. And one of the best ways I think is through social media and young people. Young people, through social media and AI, they're out there. They're vibrant. And I think that we have to do that.

But as far as I'm concerned, I support that. But I also think that we want to do it right. And if you need more money, please come on back to the commission. And let's make this a success story. Thank you.

President Brandon: He has an open checkbook. [laughter] [applause]

Commissioner Lee: Sure.

President Brandon: Vice President Gilman.

Vice President Gilman: Well, first of all, I support the item. And I align myself with everyone's comments. I'm sure Randall and your team are getting a lot of unsolicited feedback. But I think that's a positive thing because we all want the same thing. So I just had a couple of comments, as someone who lives a stone's throw from where you're doing this activation.

I do think, when you come back -- because you're going to need to come back and ask us for more funds -- it would be nice if you could brainstorm or think about a local activation program for locals. Bread and butter might be during the summer tourists. But as every restaurant or club in Chinatown, North Beach knows, when you're not in the summer, the locals are what keep it going.

And quite honestly, I don't think locals go down to Little Embarcadero because they don't think anything is there for them. So I think some sort of promotion or activity around that would be really, really important. Also really -- I know this is a long shot.

But I'm going to use my podium here to say to go to the SFMTA commission meeting because the bus yard on Powell, which is the gateway down to this whole entire area, is completely dark, seems unsafe. And there's no way you would know, if you had spent -- if you'd gone to dinner in Chinatown, had a beer in North Beach and you wanted to continue down, there's no lightage. There's no way find. There's no way to get there.

So I just want to really think about how you think also from other departments within the City and County of San Francisco they can assist with that activation and wayfare signing -- or signage I think is super important as well. We have The North Beach Festival this weekend, where I think hundreds of thousands of people are descending on the neighborhood.

And it would be great if they funneled down to Fisherman's Wharf. But there's no connection point to any of that. So I just wanted to add that. And then, I just really wanted to add too that I'm very excited to see how, in particular, the images around the lighting along the promenade -- I'm really hoping that deters street vending.

And please be nimble because I'm a little more concerned actually that, in some ways, it might attract street vending just by looking at the signs that they're going to take over those little kiosks. So you know, again, that's something that turns off locals. And I think, particularly since we have seen illegal alcohol and drug sales, it turns off families as well particularly because it's so close to the Ferris wheel.

So I wish you luck. I think we all really, really support this. And again, it'd be great to come back with what the stewards are doing and with maybe how to do more of how to do in-reach into the local community of all the residents that live along your borders. Thank you.

President Brandon: Thank you. Thank you, Mike, Meghan and Julie, for your report. Great information. And I agree with my fellow commissioners that this was a good investment. And we should continue.

But I would really love to hear from the CBD staff on how you think things have gone. And what could we do better? And are we going in the right direction? And then, I also want to know what are the plans for the future. How are we going to reengage the waterside tenants to invest in this area also?

Randall Scott: President Brandon, Vice President Gilman, Director Forbes and commissioners, my name is Randall Scott. I'm the executive director for Fisherman's Wharf CBD. And how is it going? I think it's going very, very well. I actually think we exceeded our own expectations for the Pier Party activation and the mural -- murals, plural.

The stewards are the ambassadors. You know, they're our ambassador staff. They engage. They're not safety ambassadors. So they're not -- you know, we did look at the budget for what it would take to hire safety ambassadors. And that kind of exceeded the dollar amount.

So if you -- when we come back next year and you want to see that in the proposal, we can add that back in. We've done very, very well. So I have metrics -- and I apologize I didn't have them for you today -- all the grass we've cleaned

up, all the graffiti we've cleaned up, all of the street furniture we've wiped down from the birds -- you know, the local fare.

And so thus far, that's what we've done. We're very excited about this Little Embarcadero project because it -- you know, to use a word that was used earlier, it elevates the space. So these pergolas are going to be 12 feet up. And we specifically designed it, so you can't put a 10x10 tent there, yet it still looks attractive. It looks like it was designed to be for a pedestrian, which it is.

I think the netted hammock -- I don't like to use the term hammock because hammock you think of swinging. We don't want swinging. It's just basically a fixed hammock that you can sit and enjoy the waterfront. I think those are going to be a big hit.

You know, they've been a big hit in Philadelphia and other cities around the globe. So the look of the greenery, the color, the kid-friendly -- you know, that is key to the development of the Little Embarcadero for locals, local moms. It's a new place to go. You know, Tunnel Tops is great. Why not bring them down to the wharf, you know? Because they come. They stay. They, you know, eat lunch. Kids get hungry. And Musee Mecanique is right there.

So if we want to dream big, you know, one of the things that we [can't] afford that we think would be a fantastic add -- and that would be a very significant play structure at that plaza space in front of Musee Mecanique because that is a very large open area.

It's right on the waterfront. It's just screaming for a playground of some sort. So that's the future, in my opinion, as well as the programming and activation for the locals. You know, we hire local bands to try and get the locals down here to realize that Little Embarc -- you know, the wharf is alive. It is a fun place to be.

You know, I get comments all the time, "Hey, I went down to the wharf. And you know what? I had a great time. It's really nice down there." It's like, well, come more often, you know. The wharf belongs to the locals. The tourists come and visit. But it belongs to San Francisco.

And that's the messaging that we need to get out is this is your wharf. Come enjoy it. And I think, with these new act -- it's new. It's fresh. There's a reason for locals to come out and rediscover the wharf. So we're happy to put together -- in fact, our first vision, I think, had a lot of things in it. And I think that was about a \$4.5 million budget.

So the CBD and our partners with Street Plans and working with Amy and the staff have been phenomenal -- and our team and our board. We can do it. We can execute on it. So we just don't have the means. So --

President Brandon: And I guess that's my next question. Are we working together to figure out how to fund this going further? Are we working on grants? Are we working on getting our tenants engaged? How are we going to bring -- how is this is going to be sustainable?

Because I think the Port only had a certain amount of funds to invest in this. And they've reallocated from other projects to make this happen. So what happens next year? Where is the funding coming from?

Randall Scott: Correct. Well, I think next year -- Meghan can answer that one. As far as -- I don't want to dip too far into this. But you know, we are looking at ways to partner and develop. The Port-side CBD at its best generated \$170,000 a year. As you can see by this budget, that doesn't even come close. It's about 10 percent of it.

So reforming the Port-side CBD now the way it existed previously as a business-based CBD was a gross receipts tax with the revenues that are being generated. That number would probably be closer to around \$80,000. So that is really not a viable option as far as funding future.

There are strategies that we can look at. A great team that we work with, Urban Place Consulting -- they've worked with other city entities around -- you know, and there are other options as well. But there are ways and mechanisms in which to do so. And we're definitely open to looking at that.

President Brandon: Okay. Thank you. I appreciate it. Meghan?

Meghan Wallace: Thank you for your questions, President Brandon. Yes. We have been looking at funding sources to support the second year of the program. Of course, we do want to continue to explore looking at ways to supplement that especially if we're being encouraged to think big and recognizing that we were trying to be typical Port, you know, and make every dime go as far as it can.

So we didn't include safety ambassadors because, if I recall, the numbers -- correct me -- was around \$700,000? It was a very large sum. And we thought that we are work-ordering funds to Public Works or other city departments who are helping us with enforcement activities.

So I think, as we're getting this up and running with this initial request for funding, we'll be looking at year two and continuing to look at different funding sources and thinking about partnerships potentially with [Port tenants], thinking about the future of the CBD and how we're all working together to get our resources to build a sustainable program.

President Brandon: I think it's a great program. And I think that we've made a huge investment, the largest investment anywhere along the waterfront into Fisherman's Wharf. And I know that, when the first [ideal] came out, it was to

activate. And I'm not quite sure that we thought it would be a long-term activation over, you know, a certain number of years.

I thought we were investing to activate so that then it could take on a life of its own. So just -- because we are -- you know, I would love to dream big all along the waterfront. I would love to be able to do everything we want to do everywhere along the waterfront. But we don't have those funds.

So that's why I was just asking, what are we doing now to plan for the future? You know, are we looking for grants? Are we looking for partners? Are we looking for reactivation? Would definitely love our tenants to invest in this regardless if it's \$50,000 or \$80,000 in revenue. I think we need to be looking at all sources of revenue to keep this a success.

Meghan Wallace: Most definitely. I will say that the Fisherman's Wharf is still in a state of economic recovery. With all of these vacancies, our tenants have a bit of an uphill battle. Right.

President Brandon: Along the waterfront.

Meghan Wallace: And along -- you know, thinking about the city convention trends --

President Brandon: Mm-hmm.

Meghan Wallace: -- you know, there are citywide impacts of declining conventions coming through. That means lower foot traffic in the wharf. So I agree with you 100 percent. We need to think about that long-term sustainability. But I also want to encourage us all to recognize that our tenants are still in that state of economic recovery and particularly with stimulus funds with that intended purpose of helping generate business for them --

President Brandon: Which is why we are discussing approving this reallocation and additional funding.

Meghan Wallace: Yes, indeed.

President Brandon: Thank you.

Meghan Wallace: Did you want to --

President Brandon: Commissioner Lee?

Commissioner Lee: Meghan, I have a question real quick. This \$700,000 you say for security -- is that for what? Private security? Police force?

Michael Martin: That was part of what I wanted to come up and talk to you -- so the fact that we're not funding security ambassadors through this grant is -- I don't want people to get the impression that we're sort of hoping that security is addressed. We've already made investments with our SFPD detail to get them seven days a week. So we have at least two officers seven days a week.

And we've also worked to get basically daily staffing from Public Works to enforce on vending at the Little Embarcadero, which we did not have before two months ago. And that has shown a marked uptick. I think the ambassadors and the staffing that we're going to see on the streets aren't going to be engaging vendors. They're going to be eyes and ears.

They're going to be working with security manager, working with those enforcement staff to enforce on unpermitted vending when it pops up. So I just wanted to be clear that that's not something we sort of cut out for economics. We have a different strategy than what's in the grant to really do the frontline enforcement.

Commissioner Lee: So when the ambassadors go out, are they radioed? Do they call the roaming police officers or Public Works people that are in the area to come and take care of this situation?

Randall Scott: So they're radioed back. They all talk. They all have radios to the management. And then, management would engage with -- if they decided to escalate the call -- to either DPW or the HEART team or -- so the manager makes the call, not just the individual ambassador on the street.

Commissioner Lee: So have you tracked the response time? I'm curious. I mean, it's like, okay. Ambassador sees an illegal vendor, call it in.

Randall Scott: We don't engage with the illegal vending at all.

Commissioner Lee: No. I know that. But you can radio the enforcement officer who's supposed to be roaming the area unless the other departments are not there. I'm just -- this is just inquiring. I'm not trying to blame anybody. But --

Randall Scott: No. Yeah. No. Usually, anything that escalates, I get a text with a picture. And I immediately send it to Kyle -- Kyle Thomas, the head of security.

Commissioner Lee: And what's the response time usually?

Randall Scott: It's -- I'm not there to -- we haven't tracked that at all.

Commissioner Lee: So I would like to know, you know, the communication. If this is how -- you know, you can't put it in your budget obviously. It's too expensive. But the Port tenants and everybody who's concerned about this thing, even

having ambassadors with three-quarters of your budget going towards them, there's got to be a better communication. Otherwise, you are wasting your time. Right.

Because you could beautify the place. And if you're not getting people to feel safe, they're not coming back. So I'm just say -- if we can tighten it up a little bit or however -- you know, if they're allocating Public Works or whatever, I'd like to know how your ambassadors are engaging them, so more action could be taken -- to protect the tenants and also the public, so they know that, hey -- then, they're right on it.

You know, I'm going to come back because I feel safe. You know, it only takes one incident. All the positive things you do, right, every good thing you do -- there's always one incident that just puts you back.

Randall Scott: Yes.

Commissioner Lee: So I just want you guys to be aware of that. And if we can allocate a little bit more funds or push the other departments to help back you up because your response time is not there, then maybe that's what we can do as this commission to tell the other commission to try to maybe step it up a little bit because, again, no matter how much you beautify the place, if we don't have foot traffic, it's not going to work.

Randall Scott: And I will work with Kyle on the chain of command on how that's going to work and --

Commissioner Lee: Okay.

Randal Scott: -- put that in our first quarterly report.

Commissioner Lee: Okay. Thank you.

Commissioner Adams: I have a question too. And this is going to be for Meghan too. Have we reached out to a state assembly member like Matt Haney to ask for some help or Senator Wiener or even, since it's in Leader Pelosi's district, to try to get some funding, to try to get some help?

And I see we've got Brother Rodney Fong, head of the Chamber of Commerce here. So I'm sure Rodney knows where a lot of money is at. [laughter] But I mean, is there anybody -- have we tapped into those resources, as President says, as far as getting funds?

But I would think all of those people that I just mentioned, especially Leader Pelosi, Matt Haney, Scott Wiener and even our former commissioner, now lieutenant governor, Eleni Kounalakis, who spends a lot of time down on the

waterfront, would want this investment. And there is money in the budget, I'm sure, in Sacramento.

And with the prestige and the power that Leader Pelosi has in D.C. to try to get some funds, the Port is putting up so much. But we need some other people to kind of help us.

Meghan Wallace: Yes. I will say that one of the biggest pushes along those lines was to secure federal stimulus funds that were then appropriated through State Lands. And we have actually put those stimulus funds to work through this first stage of the grant. The \$2.2 million is fully stimulus funded.

But I think, moving forward and to the extent that -- I agree with you. We should keep looking at other options for funding and tell our story. And we can work within Port staff to plan for those outreach efforts for seeking more funding.

Director Forbes: If I could just clarify, so we are supplementing the work of the CBD because the waterside CBD did not vote to continue. And we are overfunding what was available before because we need a lot of work done there. This is all stimulus money. This is Leader Pelosi's money to us to make this waterfront a better place.

And we're doing it in an emergency short-term concept post pandemic. We are not permanently going to fund the CBD. That's the businesses and the CBD's job to figure out how it's funded. Further, we take care of security. So if we've got problems with security, we'll work with Randall's team. But we have our security strategy.

So I don't want anyone in the room feeling like, if we don't have enough for the CBD, it's going to be a crime problem in the wharf because we don't believe that to be the case. We have a different strategy. And it's working well. So I just wanted to clarify those two points.

So my staff has been directed this is our last time as the Port because this is the stimulus money we have. So we've been asking the CBD and working together to say, okay, then what happens next? We all want to pull together to what happens next. But I just wanted to make those clarifying comments.

Vice President Gilman: So Director Forbes, I was just curious. If we need to have this under new business, I understand that. So I just wanted to preface that.

Director Forbes: Sure.

Vice President Gilman: Can we apply for community project funding? Congress just released those -- what I'll call federal earmarks for the '25 budget. They all got released, I think -- I mean, only because I know from my day job -- not in San Francisco [and] other parts of the country we applied for -- we applied

for them. So I'm just curious if the Port applied for any infrastructure projects in general --

Director Forbes: We did.

Vice President Gilman: -- and if we thought about, for the '25 budget, applying for anything for this. That's just a question for new business, not for right now.

Director Forbes: Okay.

Vice President Gilman: And then, to Randall and his team -- because I don't think it's the place for as a city and county entity -- I would hope, too, you'd be looking particularly to foundations to fund -- like [Eat. Play. Learn.] from the Curry's, which just set up shop, you know, on the other side of the waterfront and other entities like that for your playground design?

I think that's an excellent opportunity for a foundation to come in or educational institute. Or -- I don't even know if the Park Alliance still exists. I know it's not a park. But I just want to say I think that's, in some ways, not a Port obligation. But I just want to encourage you and your team to be looking for foundation and philanthropic support. And maybe the chamber can help you with that as a way to supplement what we're doing.

President Brandon: Any other questions or comments? Then, I'll finish. [laughter] I also think it's interesting that you're going to put the kiosks out there. And I think that's a great idea. Can you tell me a little bit about that RFP process and selection process?

Amy Cohen: Hi, commissioners. It's Amy Cohen. It was not an RFP. So this is a pop-up program through the community benefit district. And it's meant to be kind of a prototype, see what works well. These containers are not going to have kitchens. They're not going to cook. [laughs]

But there is a demand, as you guys can -- as everyone can see, there is a demand to buy stuff out there, especially by the wheel. So they put out a call for interest. They received eight proposals. It's a range. It's between some retail, some take-away food and drink and some experiential stuff like tickets for experiences in the wharf.

And it's all from San Francisco-based, wharf-based or very close to the wharf-based businesses. So --

President Brandon: So only to wharf-based businesses, not to the greater area?

Amy Cohen: Not only -- you mean where did the call for projects go?

President Brandon: Yeah.

Amy Cohen: It went out through the CBD's networks. So it went to the general wharf area but beyond Port tenants -- including but beyond Port tenants.

President Brandon: Did it go to the various chambers? Did it go to -- or was it just limited --

Amy Cohen: I don't think so because we knew that we only had four containers maximum. And we also need -- there's a lot of stipulations with this program where these vendors are going to be sharing the containers with tables and chairs that need to be stored overnight and games. We didn't talk about the games.

So we're really trying it on kind of a small scale right now. And if it works well, the initial agreements that they do will get extended. And it will become more of a sort of a thing. And maybe we can get more containers if we could fit them in.

President Brandon: Well, I hope it's successful. And I hope, in the future, we can be equitable and open it up to more diverse communities and organizations. So with that, it is time to vote if there are no other questions or comments. All in favor?

Resolution 24-31 passed unanimously.

12. WATERFRONT RESILIENCE PROGRAM

A. Informational presentation on public outreach, engagement, and feedback on the San Francisco Waterfront Coastal Flood Study Draft Integrated Feasibility Report and Environmental Impact Statement (Draft Report) and City and regulatory agency comments on the Draft Report.

Adam Varat: Good afternoon, President Brandon, commissioners, Director Forbes. Adam Varat, the deputy program manager for planning for the waterfront resilience program. I'm joined by my colleague, Luiz Barata, who is our senior planner with a focus on the outreach and engagement work that we've been doing as it relates to the Army Corps flood study draft plan that we've recently released.

So I'm going to give just a very brief overview on the plan, a sort of refresher -- you've seen this before in early February -- and turn it over to Luiz to talk about what we've heard through the outreach and engagement process. And then, I'll talk a little bit at the end about what the city's kind of comment/response has been and some of the issues that we are working with the Army Corps of Engineers to address.

So as a background, the flood study is a partnership between the Army Corps of Engineers and the City of San Francisco with the Port as the lead

agency. We're studying the impacts of sea-level rise and coastal flooding on the Port's waterfront along the seven-and-a-half mile jurisdiction over the next 100 years.

We released the draft plan for public comment at the end of January. It was a huge milestone. We were really excited, had a very great engagement program, which Luiz will share. And that's kicked off a kind of formal engagement period through the economic policy analysis as well as on the draft report and draft plan itself.

As you may recall, the draft plan proposes a set of adaptation actions for the shoreline that has an approximate cost of about \$13.5 billion. And this would go before U.S. Congress. And if it were approved, the Congress would pay -- federal government would pay up to 65 percent of the cost with the remainder coming from non-federal, state or local -- and local sources.

So a refresher on where we are in the study -- we are now towards the end of the -- but not at the end of the kind of feasibility study phase. We released the draft plan in February or January, as I mentioned. And we're working towards a recommended plan to Congress by the end of 2025.

That would then go before Congress for approval and authorization and appropriation of funding through the Water Resources Development Act in 2026 and move into more detailed design and engineering phases. And you know, this is a massive undertaking. It is not something that would necessarily be funded or built in one step. It would be kind of built and phased in multiple stages over decades.

Here is an overview of what's in the plan, which you've also seen before. Essentially, the plan proposes elevating and adapting the existing shoreline along most of the Port's waterfront from about Pier 27 to Heron's Head Park using a combination of raised seawalls, flood walls, levies and berms as well as kind of nature-based features where we can incorporate them.

We would also be adapting and elevating the historic bulkhead buildings and the wharves that they sit on including the Ferry Building. And we would be adding flood-proofing of select buildings in the Fisherman's Wharf area, which is a little bit higher elevation, more protected than the other areas as well as around the historic finger piers.

So that's just a refresher on the plan. And with that, I'm going to turn it over to Luiz to talk through the outreach and engagement.

Luiz Barata: Thank you, Adam. Good afternoon, President Brandon and commissioners. I'm Luiz Barata. I'm a senior planner with the waterfront resilience program. I will talk about what this engagement that took over during the months of -- from January to March 2024. And I want to start by saying thank

you to all the community members who participated in this effort, all the community-based organizations that worked with us, all the community advisory councils.

We also worked with city agencies. So I want to say thank you. We have champions of the city agencies. Some of them actually volunteered too in some of those events -- and also to the Port staff and our consulting team.

So the engagement included about 14 events that were open to the public including community workshops, waterfront walking tours, Webinars. We had over 50 briefings to the community organizations, the community advisory councils, the agencies and Port tenants. And we had about 970 people that participated across all those events.

We also had updated our website with story maps in multiple languages including we also had social media. We had a postcard campaign. And we had also applied to the Department of Human Resources for a collaboration for -- with their San Francisco fellows.

So we got four San Francisco fellows that came to the Port over 10 weeks. And they worked with the San Francisco Unified School District Climate Action Fellows. We did a workshop of them. And they also prepared a career pathways in relation to climate adaptation work.

These two tables show the overview of those 14 events -- the public events that we had. And those included walking tours, the community workshops across all the geographies that we worked on, [two] language workshops, one in Spanish and one in Chinese and also Webinars.

And also, the table to the right -- it shows all the board and commission hearings. So we had about 12 of those boards that extended from here, Port Commission, the Youth Planning Commission and MTA, PUC, you know, across different departments, BCDC and others.

And so those workshops -- the idea was to go to the community and talk about both the flood study and the draft plan. So we presented the plans to them. And the objective was to get comment and public feedback on the draft plan. And basically, we -- in those workshops, we had oral presentation.

And then, we had tables with different sections of the waterfront and in a science-fair style. So people could go to those tables and ask questions and also provide comments. As part of the [unintelligible], we also had a [court] recorder that people could provide comments also to them and be recorded. So across those workshops, we had about almost 400 people that attended those workshops.

And we also had the walking tours. And the walking tours were one of the most successful ways of reaching out to the community. As we heard from the community, they really enjoying going out and seeing the waterfront and seeing how their work is going to impact them. So we hosted four of those walking tours across [other] the geographies.

And we also had two we call royal guides walking tours, which are the -- as known as king tides -- with the Exploratorium. That was a partnership we have with them. And those tours -- they offer an opportunity for the public to experience what the waterfront could look like in the future with the sea-level rise. In addition, we had city and partner support in those tours.

So I'm going to provide -- you know, it's a very summarized collection of those comments, what we heard overall. We had a lot of conversations and received over 150 written comments that [unintelligible] received. And here is some of what we heard overall.

So one of the things that we heard is there's: a strong support for nature-based solutions across the waterfront, as we're implementing this work; desire to preserve and expand the recreational uses; request for opportunities for local businesses and workers and the contracts.

We heard a lot of concerns about the health impacts from contamination and groundwater flooding. We also heard about concerns from the jurisdiction of this draft plan so what the city is doing beyond the project's jurisdiction both to the south of Heron's Head Park and also to the west of the Aquatic Park.

And we also received a lot of comments regarding the funding, how the city is going to come up with the 35 percent match, phasing, construction impacts, of course the [business] disruptions and also tenants' disruptions, tenant relocations and those economic impacts.

So this is a very brief list of some of those comments where we received in each one of those areas. Fisherman's Wharf: support for the nature-based solutions; preserve the recreation swimming and boating -- that's very important to that area in particular -- coordination of those planning efforts across all those projects; and concerns about the construction impacts.

In the Embarcadero, we heard about: also, impacts on the historic district; also concerns of disruption of the work; preserving the Ferry Building and farmer's market -- that's a community asset that the community values -- and also think about opportunities to rethink the future of the Embarcadero.

In Mission Creek/Mission Bay: again, support for those nature-based solutions -- there is a lot of environmental concerns here with the water quality in the creek and how the project would have some mitigations on the impact; and also those recreational uses in the Mission Creek Channel; and concerns about

wastewater impacts with the all the infrastructure and the activities that are around the creek.

In the Islais Creek/Bayview, some of the concerns were about: the limits of the Port study area -- so what's happening south of Heron's Head Park -- again, health impacts regarding some of the contaminated sites was a big concern; concerns about the combined sewer/stormwater overflows to the Bay and the desire for local workforce opportunity and job creation.

For the in-language workshops, we heard about: an opportunity to increase investments in areas that have been historically not included in some of those investments; concerns about groundwater contamination; timeline for funding, potential funding and opportunities for the city.

We also heard about: concerns about preserving nature; and opportunities for job creation; and the construction impacts on tourism, transportation networks and traffic. But also, they highlighted the importance of increasing this public awareness around this project. And I will pass to Adam, who will talk about the city next steps.

Adam Varat: Thank you, Luiz. I want to point out that Luiz is in every photo of the public outreach because he's [attended] [laughter] all the events and worked very hard for two months.

President Brandon: I saw that.

Vice President Gilman: Yeah.

Adam Varat: So we also have received a number of comments along with the Army Corps. We received a number of comments in addition to the public comments from the regulatory and public agencies, which were included as part of the packet for you. I'm not going to go into the details of those.

But you can see some of the agencies that are included here as well as the city put together a comment letter of an official formal comment letter on the draft report sort of saying here are the things that the city is concerned about as we go through the process of refining the plan and finalizing the report to recommend to Congress, here are the -- and as we move into future steps of design and implementation, here are the concerns and considerations that we, as a city, care about.

I think these are reflective of a lot of overlap with the public comments as well as what we heard from the city's boards and commissions including yourselves. So you can see some of the topics -- kind of main topics that we focused on the city comment letter here.

They were less about specific changes and more about kind of fundamental approaches to the project and how we might kind of either expand the scope or refine the project. So I'm just going to touch on kind of three of these. And I think, you know, any plan revisions that we would make the draft plan when we look at it from the sort of Army Corps lens, I really want to see, okay, how is this either reducing cost, increasing benefits across that sort of comprehensive-benefit framework or decreasing environmental impacts?

So any revisions we're making to the plan, that's sort of the framework of thought that we're using. So Luiz touched a little bit on this in sort of the public comment. It's a frequent comment that we hear and have heard over the last several years in relation to the project is, "Well, what happens south of the project study area?" particularly when we do outreach to the Bayview community.

What happens south of the study area? So we have been working with other city agencies as well as the Army Corps of Engineers to look at this area. As you know, a lot of it is part of the Candlestick/Hunters Point Shipyard redevelopment area that does include adaptation plans as part of that project.

There is one kind of gap which is the Yosemite Slough area. So we are exploring right now with the Army Corps the potential of including that as sort of a spinoff or future study so that there's an adaptation plan for that area as well, which shares a lot of characteristics with the Islais Creek channel.

One of the other major issues is the kind of inland drainage and combined sewer infrastructure. There's a couple issues -- kind of sub issues related to this. Right now, the study looks at, if you build up and adapt the shoreline, you create this sort of bathtub effect where you kind of trap overland stormwater behind the new elevated shoreline defense system. And you need to do something to address that with pumping and storage and other stormwater-management techniques.

So we really need to refine that, get better cost estimates and designs and alignment between the Port, the SFPUC and the Corps of Engineers. We're also looking at the potential of studying that as a changing issue, as climate continues to change. Storms become more extreme. And what is the impact of sea-level rise in general on the inland drainage system so not just the impact of the project but the impact of just rising sea levels?

And that would be an area of further study that might also become a spinoff study to this one without slowing down this study. But that's something we're kind of currently in discussions with the Army Corps about. And finally, as Luiz mentioned, another big issue that we have heard a lot from the community about and becomes a very big sort of community health issue as well as a sort of project delivery and implementation issue is the contaminated sites that are present in the study area.

The Army Corps has a policy of not addressing contaminated sites or taking on liability. So it's something that the local sponsor needs to take on and understand. So right now, you know, we believe we have sort of information about Port property and the levels and types of contamination that's on Port property.

The SFPUC is researching what's going on in those creek channels under an order from the regional water board. But there are some areas that we need to do additional investigation to understand what's there, so we can understand what to do about it and how to take remedial actions and how that needs to play into this project. So we are continuing to work towards developing that information base so that we can address it.

So those were some of the kind of highlights from the city comment letter and some of the kind of more technical engineering issues. Just an overview to close out on kind of where we are in this flood study process and where we're going from here -- so you can see we had the kind of draft report publication, major milestone in January, a 60-day comment period that ended at the end of March.

And since then, we've been working with the Army Corps to go through these comments as well as look at kind of technical policy and agency comments and talk about, how are we going to refine plan. And we're going to hit this -- another major milestone, sort of an internal Army Corps milestone called the agency decision milestone at the end of June where sort of say, okay, this is the path towards getting to a final report.

Here's how we think -- here's the further analysis you need to do. Here's the changes that we -- the major changes we see making to the plan based on all of this comment we're getting. And then, go do that, and then develop the final report, which we expect by the end of next year.

And then, it will go before Congress -- sorry -- by the middle of next year. And then, it will go before Congress in the form of an Army Corps chief's report in 2026. So that's kind of the overview of the next steps and where we're going. And with that, I will close out. Thank you.

Public Comment on Item 12A:

Alice Rogers: Good afternoon again, President Brandon, commissioners, Director Forbes. I'm Alice Rogers, current president of the South Beach/Rincon/Mission Bay Neighborhood Association. And I'm just here to corroborate the many, many, many outreach opportunities that were provided to our swath of the waterfront.

And we're just one portion. And I know that we weren't favored necessarily. But at every turn, there was another presentation. And indeed, Luiz

was not only in every photo, but I think he was at every presentation as well. The walking tours were particularly successful.

And the community open houses were very fun, very interesting, wonderfully staged with a lot of materials. So I just want to say, from our three neighborhoods' perspective, this was really successful outreach. Thank you.

Commissioners' Discussion on Item 12A:

Commissioner Harrington: Thank you, Madam President. So thanks very much again for all the work that's gone into this. The three items you picked on the back are the ones that were obviously of most interest as you heard from the different people.

I'm not sure I understand when we say, "Requires approval by the assistant secretary to the Army. Most work would occur in the design phase." Is that like 2040? When does that kind of thing happen?

Adam Varat: Are you referring to all of them?

Commissioner Harrington: Well, I'm looking -- that's the language under inland drainage. And that's the same language under environmental contamination. And half of that is under Yosemite Slough.

Brad Benson: So in terms of the combined flood risk, typically the Army Corps has looked at coastal storm risk or riverine flood risk. And they will look at stormwater problems associated with the solutions that they develop. In 2022, Congress adopted a provision of the Water Resources Development Act that, under approval by the assistant secretary of the Army, these studies can start to look at combined flood risk in a more holistic way.

We're still researching this as an option. It's something that New York exercised as part of their study. And so we're trying to get a meeting with the assistant secretary of the Army to see if it's appropriate for this study. And we actually think we're pretty far along. We've already developed our plan largely.

We don't want this really important work to slow down the work that's going on right now. And we've seen in other jurisdictions, Norfolk as an example, where this type of work has followed. It wouldn't be 2040. It'd be a few years down the road if we get approval for it.

Commissioner Harrington: So it's not in the next year --

Brad Benson: No.

Commissioner Harrington: -- obviously. So when people are asking about this, what we're really saying is we'll come back to you in three years, five years to see if it's in there?

Brad Benson: We need more --

Commissioner Harrington: Some expectation?

Brad Benson: We need more information from the assistant secretary of the Army. So I can't really answer that. One thing that Director Forbes has emphasize is like this is an issue that really is a PUC type of issue.

Commissioner Harrington: Right. Right.

Brad Benson: So we need clarity that the PUC is at the table, wants to pursue this approach and will be an active partner in this kind of study.

Adam Varat: Can I just clarify one thing, which is that part of the answer to that question is within this study, which is getting to greater alignment between PUC, Port and Army Corps on what are the needs as it relates to the project in terms of the inland drainage system and getting to a realistic cost estimate for that and needing more detail on that. And that is happening through this study.

Commissioner Harrington: Good. I mean, unfortunately, the PUC has been forced by the other agencies to do some work that won't help. And they're spending a billion dollars on Alemany right now that will meet a five-year-storm need, which won't be a [one-year] storm need by the time it happens. So -- but yeah. Okay. Thank you.

Vice President Gilman: [laughs]

President Brandon: Thank you.

Vice President Gilman: We're going to miss you.

President Brandon: Commissioner Adams?

Commissioner Adams: Great report. A couple questions -- one question was you're trying to get a meeting with the assistant secretary of the Army. How successful have you been?

Brad Benson: So the Army Corps reports up through the assistant secretary of the Army. That's the president's appointee. Michael Connor is his name. He's had staff who've participated in our big milestone meetings. So Robyn Colosimo attended our tentatively selected plan meeting and is scheduled to attend this agency decision milestone meeting that's coming up later in June.

We're trying to get a meeting with her staff to get better educated about this new provision of law. And I will just report that, so far, they've been very supportive of the work in the study. So Robyn Colosimo came out to San Francisco, was on a boat tour when we had our tentatively selected plan meeting. They really appreciate the sort of multi-benefit approach in the study.

Commissioner Adams: Well, congratulations on trying to get some of that \$16 billion. I wanted to point out the concerns about public health and contamination in groundwater. And I know that you went to the different areas. And different areas had different concerns.

Like the Embarcadero people are worried about the Ferry Building. But like if you went down to Hunters Point and other areas, they were worried about sewage, sewer, backup waste and job opportunity. So I was really glad that you broke that up into the area.

Was there one theme that you kind of found in all the areas that kind of connected? Or were all their concerns just kind of different?

Luiz Barata: Yeah. Thank you. I think the support for nature-based solutions is one of the things that we heard from the public very strongly. So people want us to use nature-based solutions as much as possible everywhere we can. So one of the things that we are looking and working on is the living seawall pilot project as a way, for instance, here in the Embarcadero, which is an area that we don't have a lot of space, to implement some of those nature-based solutions.

It is one way that can be implemented. But again, like of course we are looking at the creeks areas. And further south, we have a little bit more space. So we are looking for other opportunities to enhance the creeks and have space for natural habitat.

I think that's one theme that we heard strongly across. And in terms of concerns, I think disruption to tenants, businesses and residents that the construction will bring, that's another -- that's a concern that I think we heard across all the geographies.

Commissioner Adams: Thank you, Madam President.

President Brandon: Thank you. Commissioner Lee?

Commissioner Lee: No questions. I just want to applaud you guys for such a thorough outreach because the whole thing is to get this thing done quickly. And you don't want the public saying they never informed me. And I can see by all these reports, all these months, you know, you guys do such a great job.

And the only comment I have is you have great meeting spaces. [laughter] Those are cool-looking meeting spaces. So anyway, good job. And thanks for all the hard work.

President Brandon: Thank you. Vice President Gilman?

Vice President Gilman: I just wanted to echo the incredible community outreach. I think we will be the one department in San Francisco where a citizen cannot say they were not informed or did not know the work we were doing. So I really, really appreciate that.

And the callouts on the last page, particularly south of the study area and how we're going to address that I think is really critical and important. And I don't want us to lose sight of that. But thank you so much for all your work. It's really how every other department should really be doing -- I won't name them -- should really be doing their community outreach. Thank you. [laughter]

President Brandon: I will echo everyone. You guys did excellent community outreach. I mean, you were everywhere, in social media, press and -- so you did a great job. So thank you so much. And I really appreciate your report and telling us how the comments will be incorporated in the study and how we'll address that. My one question is Yosemite Slough. Is the Port responsible for Yosemite Slough?

Brad Benson: Port owns some property around Yosemite Slough. There was a former rail right-of-way that intersects the creek that the Port owns. There are other owners as well, other public-agency owners, state park zones, land in that area. PUC has been working for a long time on a super-fund designation for the site, working with EPA on a clean-up plan for that area.

We've talked about Yosemite Slough. This is an area where we think, if we can entice the Army Corps to come in -- and it does seem like they're very interested in coming in to this area -- we need to get other city agencies to be part of this process.

The planning department's already gotten a grant from the State of California in the amount of \$650,000. But to really engage with the Corps, we'll need Public Works and engineering skillset, economic skillset to support a study like this and can't say for sure that this is going to end up where we all want it to end up. But it appears headed in the right direction.

President Brandon: And is that just for Yosemite Slough or that entire area?

Brad Benson: The complicating factor is that the development projects, as I think Adam mentioned, have adaptation plans in them. And the Army Corps, when they're doing feasibility studies like this, has a rule that, if you've already

got an adopted plan to address sea-level rise, they're not going to come in and re-plan it.

So that played out on Port property as well with the Mission Rock projects and the Pier 70 project that had adaptation in them. The plan that we were talking about tonight connects to those areas but didn't re-plan the sea-level rise improvements. Same is true for the shipyard and Candlestick. But Yosemite Slough is the gap that wasn't planned for adaptation purposes.

President Brandon: Okay. Great. Great. So we just have to make sure that DPW steps up. [laughter]

Brad Benson: We're reaching out to them now.

President Brandon: [laughs] Thank you. Thank you. I really appreciate the report. And I really appreciate all the engagement you have received during this entire project. And you know, as I always say, we are so lucky to have this partnership and so lucky to be at the forefront of this planning process. So thank you all for your hard work. Thank you very much. Next item, please.

13. NEW BUSINESS

Director Forbes: I have recorded three items for you. The first is for staff to look to see if fish processors -- we can add those fish processors to our program of relief. And we'll get back to you on that in a future meeting, possibly the next meeting.

My second item is to update on past and future community funding requests made by the city's congressional delegation. And my final one is we will look for an equitable approach to the kiosks with the CBD and will come back to you under equity on director's report. Is there any other new business?

President Brandon: Any other new business? Seeing none. Can I have a motion?

14. ADJOURNMENT

ACTION: Vice President Gilman moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Adams seconded the motion. All commissioners were in favor.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:30 p.m.