Agenda Item No. 6

# Staff Report

Meeting Date: March 11, 2024 – 5:00PM

Location: Pier 1, The Embarcadero - Bayside Conference Room San Francisco, CA 94111

То:	Waterfront Design Advisory Committee:	
	Alma Du Solier	Jimmy Chan
	Laura Crescimano	Kathrin Moore
	Chris Wasney	

- From: Ryan Wassum and Dan Hodapp Port Planning
- Re: Joint WDAC and Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) Design Review Board (DRB) meeting (second meeting) to review proposed exterior alterations to the San Francisco Ferry Building and Ferry Plaza at various locations along the ground floor and the building site.

### Summary

This is the second joint meeting with the Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) Design Review Board (DRB) and the Port's Waterfront Design and Advisory Committee (WDAC) to review the proposed interior ground floor and exterior public space enhancements to the Ferry Building (the committees previously met on April 10<sup>th</sup>, 2023). The role of the WDAC is to review and provide recommendations on the proposal's consistency with the goals and policies outlined in Chapter 2 of the <u>Port's Waterfront Plan</u>, specifically, under sub-chapters Public Access and Open Space, Urban Design and Historic Preservation, and Diversity of Activities and People.

The Ferry Building Enhancements ("Project") as proposed by Hudson Pacific Properties ("Hudson"), the current lease holder, is to increase public access and visitation, and maximize use of interior and exterior spaces while minimizing the alteration of the Building's historic architecture. The purposes of the Project are to build an evening customer base to support and sustain the merchants, and to improve the quality and use of the Building's public spaces. Enhancements to activate the Embarcadero frontage include weather protection for the arcades and other entry areas, and canopies to shelter outdoor dining. Along the south end of the Ferry Building, furnishings, lighting, and identity features are proposed to enhance the unused area adjacent to the Building and strengthen the pedestrian identity of the Ferry Building's exterior areas.

# **Project Site/ Existing Conditions**

The project site is located on the east side of the Embarcadero Roadway at the base of Market Street. The Ferry Building is surrounded by: Pier 1 to the north; the Downtown Ferry Terminal berths and the Bay to the east; the WETA /Embarcadero Plaza to the south; and the

Waterfront Design Advisory Committee Ferry Building Enhancements (2<sup>nd</sup> Review) March 11, 2024

Embarcadero Roadway to the west. Since its reopening in 2003 following the multi-year rehabilitation, the Ferry Building has become an important destination, not only for the expanded ferry service, but as a regional "Market Hall" supporting the sustainable food movement.

# Planning Context/ Background

The Ferry Building opened in 1898 as the Union Depot and Ferry House and functioned as a main transportation hub connecting the City of San Francisco with communities throughout the Bay Area. Initially the ground floor was used primarily for ticketing services, baggage and freight handling, and storage, while the second floor served as the primary circulation path for ferry arrivals and departures.

The Ferry Building was designated a City and County of San Francisco Landmark in 1977 and listed in the National Register of Historic Places (National Register) in 1978. The Ferry Building underwent a complete rehabilitation in 2003 that was respectful of its status as a landmark and its position on the National Register. In 2006, the Ferry Building became a contributor to the Port of San Francisco Embarcadero Historic District and was again listed in the National Register.

# **Proposed Project Overview**

The following description of the Project is based on the Ferry Building Enhancements exhibit (**Exhibit B**) developed by Hudson's project architect, Page & Turnbull, and landscape architects, Einwiller Kuehl, dated March 11, 2024, and are each described in greater detail below under "Proposed Improvements".

Hudson identifies four goals for the Project:

- 1. Build a strong evening customer base to support Ferry Building merchants'
  - Provide light, heat and shelter to address the needs of evening visitors around the building.
  - Introduce warm lighting at the front of the building to pull people into an active evening food hall.
  - Grow the number local of restaurants that could draw foot traffic to Food Hall merchants in the evenings.
- 2. Improve the quality of public spaces
  - Support expanded events in Ferry Plaza with new lighting and electrical infrastructure.
  - Increase public seating and amenities across the site.
- 3. Strengthen identity and awareness of public spaces and circulation
  - Draw people to Ferry Plaza with a new gateway sign that includes ferry gate wayfinding.
  - Frame and define Ferry Plaza with new lighting on two sides.
  - Announce Ferry Plaza at the Embarcadero with a cornerstone feature that materially references the adjacent WETA Plaza.
- 4. Continue civic stewardship of the historic resource, transit hub and foodwise Farmers Market

Waterfront Design Advisory Committee Ferry Building Enhancements (2<sup>nd</sup> Review) March 11, 2024

### Proposed Improvements

**Ferry Plaza and South End of the Ferry Building** (Exhibit B, p. 25 – 42)

Improvements at the south end of the Ferry Building are proposed to soften the expanse of paving adjacent to the Building and create a welcoming pedestrian character with café seating, public seating, planters, and lighting. Improvements will also clarify pedestrian circulation routes. The public spaces and circulation will have a clear visual structure with graphics on the pavement, crosswalks, and furnishings that welcome pedestrians and define accessible routes to and from Ferry Plaza and ferry gates. Changes to this area include:

- Identity Features: A new 20-foot-high by 24-foot-wide gateway sign over the drive aisle to direct pedestrians and vehicles to Ferry Plaza and ferry gates; at the southwest corner of the Ferry Building, a new granite cornerstone that mirrors the materials of the new WETA Plaza and anchors the pedestrian improvements at the south end of the Building; and a ground mosaic to mark the Ferry Building's southern entrance.
- **Outdoor Dining.** A café area at the eastern half of the south end of the Ferry Building with tables, chairs, umbrellas, and planters that can be moved for Farmers Market use.
- **Public Seating.** Movable tables and chairs at the south end of the Building near the Embarcadero and on Ferry Plaza.
- **Drive Aisle Graphic**. Pavement painting referencing the WETA Plaza paving on the drive aisle/fire lane where adjacent to the Ferry Building to communicate the driveway being a shared use space. The accessible path of travel would continue to be the walkway between the shared use driveway and WETA Plaza.

The Ferry Plaza is a broad paved area that is currently used for over 200 daily deliveries to Ferry Building merchants (mostly before 11 a.m.), public seating, weekly markets, and special events. To make the Plaza more attractive for daily public use and special events, improvements would include:

- **Public Seating:** Movable tables and chairs for 80 people that can be relocated to the edges on market days.
- **Lighting:** To frame and better define the expanse of Ferry Plaza and to extend its use into the evening, light poles would be added along its south and west edges.
- **Mosaic Medallions:** Ground mosaics would be added at the Ferry Building's three eastern entrances.

### Entry Portico and Arcades (Exhibit B, p. 43-55)

The entry Portico is centrally located on the western face of the Ferry Building fronting the Embarcadero and is the building's primary entry. The entry Portico is flanked on either side by the north and south Arcades. Each open-air arcade contains approximately 4,130 square feet that is currently used for storage, commercial tenants, pedestrian circulation, and unprogrammed space. Hudson would enclose the north and south arcades and add fixed canopies and seating to the outdoor spaces directly in front of the Arcades.

Hudson finds the area inside the Portico and north and south Arcades to be dark when viewed from outside, and they give the impression that the building and Market Hall may be closed. To create an 'open' and inviting appearance and attract viable tenants, glazed walls and doors

would be placed in the Arcade's repeating archways. The glazing would also provide weather protection for inclement and evening hours.

To make the entry into the Porticos and Market Hall more comfortable the glazed doors and windows located at the north and south edges of the Building's central entry area would be moved forward one bay towards the Embarcadero. There are no proposed changes to the historic stairs or the non-historic glazed entry doors partway up the stairs.

The schedule for glazing the south Arcade and adding its canopy would occur at a later date and be coordinated with future leases and/or lease renewals for those areas, requiring authorization from the Port. The Port will factor in the success of the north arcade and outdoor dining canopy when considering whether to allow Hudson to build-out and program the south arcade.

Within the arcades the roll-down metal grille system mounted behind each opening would be removed, and metal framed operable glass partitions with fixed transoms would be installed behind the openings. The Port and Hudson would develop an operations plan to require the glass wall systems to remain open to the outside except in cool conditions, inclement weather, and after hours, approximately 6 months of the year. The larger circulation openings would have a similar operable glass wall system that would be full height to the bottom of a fixed grille/louver supplying air intake to the interior space. The operable glass wall systems would be hidden behind each column when fully opened. The large rectilinear openings at the edges of the central Building entry would be left open and contain mechanical vents with decorative grilles at the top portion of their openings to provide required fresh air and exhaust for the Arcades. These necessary vents with decorative grilles would replace the rolling overhead doors and decorative grilles that were installed as part of the 2003 renovation. A permanently fixed in place glazed wall with glazed doors would be installed at the north end of the Arcade with a glazed operable partition for closure. This pattern may be replicated in the south Arcade at a future phase.

Within the full length of the arcades, the space may be subdivided into two commercial units with demising gates. The forward portion of a demising wall made of glazing (closest to the Embarcadero) would be transparent and operable.

Proposed enhancements to the public space between the Ferry Building and the Embarcadero Promenade include a lightweight metal-framed canopy in front of each arcade. The canopies would be separated from the Building by a six-foot wide circulation corridor. The canopies would contain lighting, signage, and moveable overhead panels for shade . Movable benches and planters would be added at edges of the canopies. Signage is not part of the current submittal and would be reviewed by Port staff per the Ferry Building Sign Guidelines.

### Previous Review by the DRB and WDAC (April 10<sup>th</sup>, 2023)

The DRB and WDAC first reviewed the Ferry Building enhancements proposal on April 10<sup>th</sup>, 2023, and requested the item return at a later date with additional information. Since the first review the proposal has been scaled back due to economic conditions and tenant and community feedback. Improvements no longer proposed by Hudson are: a retail kiosk in Ferry Plaza and surface enhancements to the Plaza and fire lane/drive aisle; the interior remodel of the Building to create two Bayfront Kitchens; and enclosure of outdoor dining areas on the east side of the building flanking the central east-west pass through.

A summary of comments from the meeting on April 10<sup>th</sup>, 2023, are listed below along with the applicant's responses and design changes.

# **Boundaries/ Lease Control:**

- Need greater clarity on lease control boundaries and public vs. private areas, especially public and privatized seating. (Applicant revised drawings accordingly, see Exhibit B p. 10-24)
- Would like the concept refined to tie elements and spaces together more clearly (e.g. Golden Gate Ferry Terminal, One Ferry Plaza East, South Promenade to WETA Plaza, etc.). (Applicant made design revisions, see Exhibit B p. 25-42)
- Need metrics on spaces that are being changed from private vs. public use in square feet (including all seating areas). (Applicant added information, see Exhibit B p. 16, 21-23)
- How are the changes in seating areas affected by microclimates? (Applicant added information, see Exhibit B p. 72)

### Farmer's Market/ Equity of Use:

- Would like to better understand the existing farmers market and how it may transition with the current proposal. How will the changes impact existing market operations? (*Applicant illustrated farmers market layouts, see Exhibit B p. 20-23*)
- Would like key metrics showing how all spaces are changing, especially the canopy area and southside of the building. (*Applicant added information, see Exhibit B p. 13-14, 29-30, 45-55*)
- Is the farmer's market being reduced or gaining space? (Applicant added information and supplemental graphics, see Exhibit B p. 12-14)

### Materiality/ Lighting/ Signage:

- Materials should be better refined to tie into adjacent spaces, taking cues from the Ferry Building and the new Ferry Terminal Plaza; some materials should be more substantial and have a civic character per the building and new Plaza. (*Applicant made design revisions, see Exhibit B p. 33-36, 42, 54-55*)
- Need greater clarity around the proposed lighting and flag poles. (Applicant made design revisions including removing banner poles, and adjusting new pedestrian light poles around the Plaza, see Exhibit B p. 39-42)
- Signage and wayfinding should be thoughtful and not detract from the building. (Commercial signage to comply with the Sign Guidelines for the Ferry Building, which are to be revised to include signs for exterior facing tenants. Signage proposals are not included in the current review, however improved identity features can be found in the Exhibit B p.34-36)

### Arcades/ Glazing Systems:

 Would like more details on the glazing systems and the closing of arcades and any other new glazed areas. How will they operate and what portions of the arcade will be open to the public during the day/evening? (Applicant added images of how the glazing systems would appear in both open and closed positions, and will explain the operation of the systems further during their presentation – see Exhibit B p. 49-53, 67-71) • How will circulation be impacted by the closures? (The enclosure of the arcades and use as restaurants will change the public's ability to freely circulate through the space due to the anticipated operational needs of prospective tenants and their use of the floor area as kitchen, bar and dining space. Additionally, when the glazed doors within the arcades are closed after hours or during cold weather conditions the space would prevent public circulation through the space. For changes to circulation, see Exhibit B p. 47)

## Shift to More Restaurant Spaces:

• Would like more clarity on the transition of the market hall to more cafes/restaurant spaces. What is causing this change? How does this affect public seating? (*Applicant added additional information and will further explain the market hall transition during their presentation – for changes to public seating see Exhibit B p. 21-23*)

# Ferry Plaza:

• Need to better understand how the proposed elements in the plaza change from daytime use to programs, special events, and evening activities. (*Applicant added illustrations of how Ferry Plaza could operate for the Market and various sizes of events, see Exhibit B p. 11-14, 39-40*)

Need more information on the retail kiosk design/ operations, siting, view impacts, and how it affects market operations. (*Applicant has removed the retail kiosk from the proposal*)

# **Consistency Review with Waterfront Plan Policies**

The WDAC reviews Port Projects to ensure consistency with goals and policies outlined in Chapter 2 of the Port's <u>Waterfront Plan</u>. Specifically, Chapter 2 identifies applicable policies under sub-sections such as *Public Access and Open Space Along the Waterfront, Urban Design and Historic Preservation, and Diversity of Activities and People*. For ease of review, the applicable policies for each sub-section are outlined in **Appendix A** and have been further analyzed for consistency by Port staff under each corresponding policy.

As presented, the Project appears consistent with most policies of the Waterfront Plan, with certain policies requiring greater review and discussion by the WDAC. Such policies are described in **Appendix A**.

In addition to the consistency review with Waterfront Plan Policies, staff have the following questions for the WDAC to consider:

- 1. Do the proposed design enhancements reflect the historic and civic nature of the Ferry Building?
- 2. Do the proposed improvements enhance circulation and connectivity to and from the Ferry Building, the Embarcadero Promenade, and Ferry Plaza?
- 3. Do the proposed activation areas along the building frontages collectively and individually promote inviting and usable public spaces?
- 4. Would the proposal to place a café/market zone and public seating area in the South Promenade activate and improve the quality of the public space?
- 5. Are the proposed canopy structures along the west side of the Building compatible with the historic district, and do they continue to allow appropriate views of the Building?
- 6. Do the proposed elements support a cohesive design?

# **Environmental Analysis**

The Planning Department is considering Hudson's request for an environmental evaluation application for a California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) determination. If the proposal is found consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and incorporates standard construction practices, it is anticipated that the proposed Ferry Building Enhancements Project will be determined Categorically Exempt from further CEQA review.

# **Regulatory Approvals**

The proposed alteration of the Landmark Building requires San Francisco Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) review and comment and possibly the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) pursuant to Article 10 of the City Planning Code. The HPC will hold a public hearing and evaluate the project's consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties in its review of the proposal.

# Adaptation to Rising Sea Levels

The entire Project site and its surroundings are anticipated to be impacted by future sea level rise. The Port's Waterfront Resilience Team is currently developing strategies to address strengthening the seawall and adapting to rising sea levels. Resilience approaches to the Ferry Building will seek to maintain the public's access to the Building and adjacent ferry terminals. All Project enhancements could be impacted by future infrastructure that may be necessary to address seismic safety and rising sea levels, and the exterior enhancements could be adjusted in the future to accommodate infrastructure changes.

# Stakeholder/Public Engagement

The project applicant has begun outreach to community-based organizations and stakeholder groups to discuss the Project. To date, these groups have included neighborhood associations, such as the Telegraph Hill Dwellers Neighbors Association (THD), Barbary Coast Neighborhood Association, and the Gateway Tenants Association; Ferry Building merchants; Foodwise, the farmers market operator; SF Heritage; local business organizations; The Building & Construction Trades Council; and Golden Gate Ferry, with additional outreach planned for BART and WETA. Letters submitted to Port or BCDC staff can be found in Exhibit D.

Since the last DRB-WDAC meeting the project applicant worked closely with Foodwise to resolve that organizations' concerns by removing the kiosk and other fixed furnishings that could impede the flexible use of the Ferry Plaza for the Farmers' Market. The project applicant has consulted with Ferry Building Merchants in group and individual meetings. Following design review, the project applicant plans to share the project at a Northern Advisory Committee (NAC) meeting to introduce the project to the public and receive comments.

# **Next Steps**

At the March 11, 2024 DRB-WDAC joint meeting, the WDAC may recommend approval of all or part of the Project or provide design direction for Hudson to address with Port staff. Upon making final recommendations, Port and City Planning staff will forward those to the Port Commission and Planning Commission as necessary, including how the proposal is consistent with the Waterfront Plan goals and policies outlined and analyzed in **Appendix A**. Further, the Port and Hudson will continue with the outreach plan for the Project with presentations at the Port Commission, the Port's Northern Advisory Committee (NAC), and the San Francisco Historic Preservation Committee (HPC). Waterfront Design Advisory Committee Ferry Building Enhancements (2<sup>nd</sup> Review) March 11, 2024

### **Attachments**

- 1. **Appendix A:** Project Consistency Analysis with Waterfront Plan Policies
- 2. Exhibit B: Ferry Building Enhancements Exhibits
- 3. Exhibit C: Page & Turnbull's Findings of Consistency
- 4. Exhibit D: Stakeholder/Community Letters
- 5. Exhibit E: Draft Minutes from 4/10/23 DRB-WDAC Joint Meeting

# Appendix A

# Project Consistency with Waterfront Plan Policies

The following Waterfront Plan Policies *(italicized)* are applicable to the proposed Project, which must be determined consistent and/or compliant. Port staff have provided an assessment of each for consistency under corresponding "Analysis" sections.

# **Chapter 2B: Diversity of Activities and People**

### Embarcadero Historic District

<u>Policy 26.</u> Encourage temporary public-oriented uses in the Embarcadero Historic District to promote a dynamic waterfront. Allow pilot projects and small business opportunities.

**Analysis:** The Project incorporates temporary and public-oriented uses with the intent to activate Ferry Plaza and adjacent public access areas and bring more people and vibrancy to the waterfront.

### Chapter 2C – Public Access and Open Space Along the Waterfront

### **Open Space Continuity**

<u>Policy 1.</u> Maintain a continuous waterfront walkway that connects parks, public access, and activity areas from Fisherman's Wharf to India Basin, provides improvements to the San Francisco Bay Trail, and follows these guidelines:

b. Keep the walkway separate from auto traffic, where feasible.

c. Provide separated walking and cycling paths, where possible.

e. Design to integrate the walkway with adjacent open spaces and activities that enhance wayfinding, social interactions, and enjoyment of the public realm.

**Analysis:** The Project maintains continuous walkways connecting public access areas, open spaces, and continuity along the Embarcadero Promenade, which are separated from the Embarcadero protected bike-lanes and vehicle traffic. Wayfinding and signage are currently not proposed as part of this Project.

<u>Policy 3.</u> Extend pedestrian walkway and public realm improvements as part of pier renovation projects and through the Blue Greenway.

a. Provide public access around the perimeter of piers wherever safe, feasible, and compatible with maritime berthing and pier operations, consistent with Maritime Policy 26 in Chapter 2A.

**Analysis:** The Project provides pedestrian public realm improvements along the southern side of the Ferry Building from the Embarcadero promenade to the Ferry Plaza. The improvements would continue to allow easy access to terminal berths and allow maintenance vehicles to access maritime and transportation facilities.

### Sequence of Open Spaces

<u>Policy 4.</u> Complete and enhance a sequence of major open spaces located at regular intervals at significant points along the waterfront.

d. Create a Ferry Plaza on the Bay side of the Ferry Building, designed to complement ferry terminal and passenger activities, farmers markets, and public gatherings and events, enjoy expansive views of the Bay Bridge, and resilience design features to adapt to rising tides.

**Analysis:** The Project would provide minor enhancements to the Ferry Plaza, including new outdoor furniture and lighting that would complement terminal/passenger movement and provide opportunities for social interaction, public gatherings, the weekly Saturday farmers market, and special events. The proposed improvements do not include resilience design features, but their temporary nature could be modified in the future to accommodate such changes.

### Variety of Open Spaces

<u>Policy 5.</u> Complete a variety of public access and open spaces that offer many recreational opportunities and enhance other uses along the waterfront. Take advantage of the attributes of each location to create different kinds of experiences (e.g., places that reflect the unique authentic characteristics of nearby neighborhoods through art or by telling the waterfront story; quiet, contemplative places for passive enjoyment; spaces that support civic gatherings and urban events that draw large crowds; environmental restoration areas; and places that appeal to children and seniors).

**Analysis:** The Project responds to the constantly changing uses on Ferry Plaza and the south and west sides of the Ferry Building by providing layout and furnishings for small social interactions, the farmers market, café uses, and large events, potentially being one of the most flexible use spaces along the Port's waterfront.

<u>Policy 7.</u> Seek ways to draw attention to underused public open space and water recreation areas.

**Analysis:** The Project proposes adding outdoor furniture and lighting to draw people to Ferry Plaza on the east side of the Ferry Building, which at times is currently an underutilized public space.

#### **Design Character**

<u>Policy 12.</u> Emphasize San Francisco Bay and the waterfront's spectacular natural setting as the backdrop for the design of most open space improvements and built features.

a. Ensure that public spaces are simple and minimalist in form and character to allow the natural beauty of the waterfront to be the strongest visual image.

b. Design public access and open spaces to further the historic, maritime, and natural character of the waterfront. Consider including design, interpretive information, art, or other features that communicate the uniqueness of the site.

**Analysis:** The Project's light improvements to Ferry Plaza are minimal to adapt to a variety of uses, and along the west side of the Ferry Building are intended to maintain views to the Building. Interpretative information and/or art are not included in the proposal.

<u>Policy 13.</u> Locate public access areas at ground or platform level, open to the sky (allowing limited covering if it enhances public access and does not support private uses above), and along the waterfront edge consistent with Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) policies.

**Analysis:** The Project maintains public access areas at ground level, and open to the sky except for the front canopy that is intended for weather protection.

<u>Policy 14.</u> Address microclimate conditions in the design and placement of new public access, open spaces, and amenities (e.g., by providing places that are sheltered from uncomfortable winds and extreme sun exposure).

**Analysis:** The Project proposes a front canopy for weather protection and greater use of the south side of the Ferry Building which is more protected from prevailing winds than other areas of the site. In addition, the glass partitions and canopy along the North Arcade would provide heating and/or shade to make users or visitors more comfortable.

<u>Policy 16</u>. Promote safety by locating and designing public access and open spaces so that they have high visibility and are well lit. Avoid creating concealed areas.

**Analysis:** The Project maintains open and unobstructed views in Ferry Plaza and other open space areas with minimal structures added. The proposal also adds lighting around the Ferry Plaza.

#### Chapter 2D: Urban Design and Historic Preservation

#### City Pattern

<u>Policy 2.</u> Recognize and strengthen the Port's role in contributing to the city's transportation system, open space network, and neighborhood identity.

a. Improve waterfront circulation by accommodating, where feasible, the various ways in which people can safely move along the length of the waterfront.
b. Continue to develop and improve the Port's public open spaces as a series of Bay edge destinations and as part of the local and regional open space network.

**Analysis:** The proposal maintains an open Embarcadero Promenade for pedestrian use and strengthens the quality of the Ferry Building's public spaces through greater activation and new furnishings.

#### Historic Preservation

<u>Policy 4.</u> Preserve and enhance the Port's historic resources and districts. a. Review, rehabilitate, and enhance the Port's significant historic resources to achieve consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

e. Provide interpretive information that communicates the waterfront's architectural, maritime, and cultural history.

g. Maintain and support the expansion of maritime berthing and activities, a form of the historic maritime use for which the waterfront was developed, to maintain the character and authenticity of the waterfront.

*i.* Consider how best to share the Port's maritime, industrial and recreational history with residents and visitors, including through special events (e.g., blessing of the fishing fleet, Fleet Week, Sunday Streets, tours of historic sites, etc.), oral histories, interpretive signage, and cultural exhibits.

**Analysis:** Hudson retained Page & Turnbull, Historic Preservation Architects, to guide the design of the proposed alterations to the Ferry Building to achieve consistency with

the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation ("Standards"). Page & Turnbull's findings of consistency are included in Exhibit C for reference. The findings conclude that the proposed scope of work is consistent with the standards because:

- The proposal will not result in a change of use of the historic property.
- The proposal will result in the addition of new features and equipment and will not remove historic fabric.
- The proposed scope of work is highly reversible and if removed in the future would allow the historic resource to substantially return to its earlier condition.
- The design of proposed new features will be simple, of a contemporary yet compatible aesthetic and fabricated of high-quality materials appropriate for the landmark building.
- The installation of glazed storefront assemblies and HVAC intake and exhaust louvers is within existing openings and with minimal attachment to lessen the impact on the historic fabric of the resource.
- The infill of the north arcade with a set of glazed folding doors will provide a certain degree of transparency and visual access into the arcade when closed due to cold weather or after business hours.
- The proposed installation of a free-standing dining canopy in front of the building is designed to be light weight in appearance and to maintain significant visual access to the north arcade and the west façade of the building.
- Interior alterations will replace non-historic retail storefronts with new finishes that will be compatible with the design aesthetic established for the Market Hall in the 2003 rehabilitation.
- The proposed enclosure of outdoor dining on portions of the non-historic and largely reconstructed east elevation of the building will not alter historic materials or spatial relationships.
- The proposal will refresh and supplement the interpretive exhibit content in the central Ferry Terminal corridor that passes through the building.

While Port staff generally agree with the above findings of consistency, staff would like to better understand the impact of the proposed scope of work on the historic character of the resource and its visibility. As the design continues to evolve, staff will review and approve an operations plan that will specify when folding glass doors within the arcade are required to remain open. When design details are further developed, including a signage program for the arcade and dining canopy, staff and Hudson will continue to outreach to stakeholders including but not limited to Foodwise, San Francisco Architectural Heritage, Telegraph Hill Dwellers Neighborhood Association, Golden Gateway Tenant and Barbary Coast Neighborhood Associations.

### Public Realm

<u>Policy 5</u>. Provide unifying elements to the length of Port property that strengthen the identity of the Port and enhance the public realm.

c. Enhance the pedestrian environment through physical interpretation of history and public art.

d. Design public spaces to be climate-sensitive, allowing for shelter, wind breaks, and sun access or shading depending on seasonal protection needs.

e. Develop standards for waterfront lighting that is pedestrian-scaled, provides safety, is sensitive to wildlife, is environmentally efficient, and enhances the quality of public space.

*f. Implement public realm improvements in conjunction with Port development projects and transportation investments.* 

**Analysis:** The Project does not modify the Embarcadero Promenade, which is the continuous open space along the Port's northern waterfront. The Project does not include interpretive information or new public art at this time. The Project provides improvements that shelter wind and sun and makes use of wind protected areas.

#### **Resilience Planning**

<u>Policy 6.</u> Integrate protection of the Port's historic and cultural assets and resources with resilience planning. Preserve the architectural character of buildings and structures important to the unique visual image of the San Francisco waterfront, to the maximum feasible extent while at the same time prudently addressing the need to perform deferred maintenance and resilience improvements.

**Analysis:** The Project is proposing light enhancements to spaces within and around the Ferry Building and Ferry Plaza. The Port is currently in the process of resilience planning and evaluating key scenarios for sea level rise and seawall protection that would best protect the area and the historic resources.

#### Views

<u>Policy 7.</u> Provide waterfront views, shoreline public access, or direct access to and from the Bay for visitors' enjoyment of the natural environment.

**Analysis:** The Project proposes light improvements on Ferry Plaza to maintain and enhance views of the Bay and Ferry Terminal activities and provides public access along the perimeter of the Pier.

<u>Policy 8.</u> Recognize, preserve, and enhance public views of the Bay, maritime uses, and historic structures.

c. From Port properties, establish new views of the Bay, maritime uses, and historic resources.

**Analysis:** The Project proposes light improvements on Ferry Plaza to maintain and enhance views of the Bay and Ferry Terminal activities.